DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Master of Arts in Social Development at the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination at any other university.

Signed on this 30th day of July 2018

Tani Piet Radebe
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to those who departed too soon;

    My father;
    Fanie Radebe;
    My sisters;
    Pontsho Roseline Radebe;
    Masebabatso Mirriam Radebe;
    Mamokgohlane Radebe;
    and
    My brother; Makoko Johannes Radebe

Robalang ka kgotso bana ba thari le re dumedisetshe ho baholo ba rona
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Firstly, I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to Almighty God for giving me the strengths and will to develop myself. I would also like to extend my gratitude to Department of Social Development for awarding me a bursary and allowing me to conduct my research in the department.

Thanks to all the participants for agreeing to participate in my study and I would forever be indebted to them.

Many thanks to my supervisor, Dr Priscilla Gerrand, for her intellectual inputs and guidance throughout the study. Your inputs and support will always be remembered and valued.

Thanks to Mr. Tshifhiwa Tshikalaha, the manager of Sustainable Livelihood Unit in Johannesburg region and his team for their assistance.

Special thanks to my colleague Nonhlanhla Mchunu for her assistance and support. Your patience and support is highly appreciated sister.

Thanks to Malitaba Sootho and Doctor Nkuna for their support and assistance.

Many thanks to my colleagues, Sellwane Songwane and Phuti Mashalane. Guys you kept me sane while the pressure was just too much.

Special thanks to my family, my mother Nomacala Radebe, my siblings Puseletso Radebe, Sajene Radebe, my niece Sibongile Radebe, my nephew Mahlomola Radebe, my cousin Dimakatso Motloung and my twin daughters Thabile and Bathabile Radebe. Your love and support kept me going and you are the reason I still want to live and prosper in this world.
ABSTRACT

The number of young women who are in receipt of Child Support Grants is increasing every year. Acknowledging that the issuing of Child Support Grants does not promote self-reliance, the Gauteng Department of Social Development adopted Welfare-to-Work Programme as an exit strategy for recipients of Child Support Grant. The programme aimed to capacitate the recipients of Child Support Grant with skills and knowledge that could enable them to secure jobs. The purpose of the study was to explore participants’ perceptions and experiences of how the programme impacted on their livelihoods. A qualitative research method, namely a case study, was utilized to conduct the research. The purposive sampling was chosen to select nine participants, namely young women who were in receipt of Child Support Grants and who completed the said programme in Johannesburg region. Semi-structured interviews were utilized to collect data and thematic analysis was utilized to analyze data. The main findings of the research were that the boot camp section of the programme had a significant impact on the participants’ lives; it was experienced as therapeutic and uplifting. Through the boot camp the participants managed to develop the self-awareness and self-understanding. However, the main objective of the programme which was to remove participants from welfare to work was not achieved. Participants remained in the welfare system when the programme ended. It is recommended the implementers of the programme do a thorough assessment of the skills required by participants to secure stable employment in their communities. The programme should be monitored and evaluated on an ongoing basis in order to make necessary adjustments to facilitate participants securing suitable employment when completing the programme.

KEYWORDS
Welfare-to-Work Programme, Poverty, Child Support Grant and self-reliance
LIST OF ACRONYMS

AFDC    Aid to Families with Dependent Children
BF    Bolsa Familia
CWP    Community Work Programme
CSG    Child Support Grant
CV    Curriculum Vitae
DSD    Department of Social Development
ESA    Employment and Support Allowance
EPWP    Extended Public Works Programme
FND    Flexible New Deal
GED    General Educational Development
GDSD    Gauteng Department of Social Development
NGO    Non-Government Organization
NPO    Non-Profit Organization
NSFAS    National Students Financial Scheme
SA    South Africa
SASSA    South African Social Security Agency
SLA    Service Level Agreement
TANF    Temporary Assistance to Needy Families
WP    Work Programme
WtW    Welfare-to-Work
USA    United State of America
UK    United Kingdom
## Table of Contents

### CHAPTER ONE
1. Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 1
2. Statement of the problem and rationale of the study .............................................................. 2
3. Focus of the study ................................................................................................................... 3
   3.1. Defining concepts ............................................................................................................. 3
4. Organisation of the report ....................................................................................................... 4

### CHAPTER 2
1. Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 5
2. Unemployment in the South African context ......................................................................... 5
3. Social security in South Africa ............................................................................................... 8
4. The child support grant ........................................................................................................... 9
5. Women empowerment .......................................................................................................... 11
6. International welfare-to-work programmes .......................................................................... 13
   6.1. Welfare-to-Work Programmes in the USA ................................................................. 13
   6.2. Welfare-to-Work Programmes in the UK ................................................................. 18
   6.3. Welfare Programme in Brazil .................................................................................. 22
7. Welfare-to-work programme in South Africa...................................................................... 26
   7.1 Overview of the Welfare-to-Work Programme in South Africa .................................. 26
   7.2 Selection of candidates to complete the programme ................................................... 28
8. Theoretical framework .......................................................................................................... 29
   8.1 Conflict theories ............................................................................................................. 29
   8.2 Social development welfare approach ........................................................................... 30
9. Conclusion ............................................................................................................................ 31

### CHAPTER 3
1. Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 33
2. Research question ................................................................................................................. 33
3. Primary aim and secondary objectives ................................................................................. 33
   3.1 Primary aim ......................................................................................................................... 33
   3.2 Secondary objectives ....................................................................................................... 33
4. Research approach and design .............................................................................................. 34
5. Research population and sample ........................................................................................... 34
6. Research tool and pre-testing thereof ................................................................................... 35
7. Data analysis ......................................................................................................................... 36
8. Trustworthiness of the study ................................................................................................. 36
   8.1 Credibility ........................................................................................................................ 37
   8.2 Transferability ................................................................................................................. 37
   8.3 Dependability ................................................................................................................... 38
   8.4 Confirmability ................................................................................................................. 38
9. Ethical considerations ........................................................................................................... 38
   9.1 Informed consent ............................................................................................................. 39
   9.2 Deception ......................................................................................................................... 39
   9.3 Confidentiality and Anonymity ....................................................................................... 40
   9.4 Avoidance of harm .......................................................................................................... 40
   9.5 Compensation .................................................................................................................. 40
10. Limitations .......................................................................................................................... 41

CHAPTER 4 ................................................................................................................................. 43
1. Introduction........................................................................................................................... 43
2. Profile of research participants ............................................................................................. 43
3. Research findings .................................................................................................................. 44
   3.1 Objective One: to investigate what motivated young women participants to engage in the welfare-to-work programme ................................................................. 44
   3.2 Objective Two: to explore what young women experienced while completing the programme ......................................................................................................................... 47
   3.3. Objective Three: to explore participants’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the programme regarding their expectations .............................................................................. 52
   3.4 Objective Four: Investigate how participants think the programme has impacted on their livelihoods ......................................................................................................................... 56
CHAPTER ONE

1. Introduction

For the past two decades, the post-apartheid government has utilized social grants as the strategy to alleviate poverty. The social grants remained the most important tool of government to uplift the lives of the vulnerable. The number of social grants in South Africa has increased rapidly over the past twenty-three years: from an estimated 4-million in 1994 to 17,443,994 by October 2017 (Ferreira, 2018).

There is currently an ongoing debate among the academics about the role of social grants. For example, some scholars believe that social grants create dependency and pose threat to South Africa’s fiscal sustainability. Others believe that social grants played an important role in empowering the poor; and that South Africa has constitutional obligation to further the progressive realization of socioeconomic rights, especially in case of the children and dignity of the elderly (Dubihlela & Dubihlela, 2014; Inchauste, Maboshe, Purfield, 2015; Mabugu & Chitiga-Mabugu, 2018; South African Child Gauge, 2016).

Over 12 million, or 63%, of South Africa’s children are currently in receipt of the Child Support Grant (CSG) (Patel et al., 2017). The CSG is the country’s flagship poverty reduction programme for children. Initially it was designed to support poor households to promote food security. However, limited resources have been earmarked specifically for prevention of social problems and to promote the capabilities of families, beyond the income support provided by the CSG (Patel et al., 2017, p. 6). It was against this backdrop that Gauteng Department of Social Development adopted Welfare-to-Work (WtW) programme to empower the Child Support Grant recipients with skills and knowledge to remove them in the welfare system. Department discovered that the CSG was dominated by young women who did not have any qualifications. Consequently, it became important to devise the strategy that could assist the recipients (Gauteng Department of Social Development, 2013).

Gauteng Department of Social Development initiated WtW programme in 2013, and the first intake was 150 participants. The programme started with the boot camp which is the intensive
workshop that took five days. The boot camp prepared the participants for the programme and helped them to understand themselves. After the boot camp participants were placed in various organisations so that they could earn work experience.

2. Statement of the problem and rationale of the study

South African welfare system continues to absorb many young women who are unemployed and could not meet the needs of their children. In May 2017, South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) accentuated that there were 1, 781, 444 people who were in receipt of child support grant in Gauteng only. Gauteng Department of Social Development (GDSD) noted that most of the recipients are young women. Neves, Samson, Van Niekerk, Hlatshwayo and Du Toit (2009) argued that the recipients of social grants are mostly African; and have lower levels of education and cannot access employment than do non-recipients. Currently Gauteng province has 579 819 youth (between 18 and 35 years) receiving CSG on behalf of qualifying recipients and 4674 are youth receiving foster-care grants. A total of 584 483 youth is on social security in Gauteng (Social Development, 2017). In view of these challenges that are faced by young women, GDSD decided to develop WtW programme to address the challenge. The programme aimed to empower young women with skills that could equip them to ultimately leave the welfare system to either access jobs or venture into starting their own business.

There are also other factors contributing to the young women, and people in general, seeking the social grants to survive. Patel and Hochfeld (2012) stated that macroeconomic policies have not created an environment conducive to sustainable and equitable economic and social development. Many recipients do not have any work skills that could assist them to be competitive in the labour market. These challenges contributed to the growing number of people in welfare system.

On the other hand, thousands of fathers are not involved in the upbringing and maintenance of their children. The high level of father absence in South Africa leads to child rearing challenges for single mothers, (Datta, 2007 cited in Smith, Khunou & Nathane-Taulela, 2014). Absence of fathers in the lives of their children leaves mothers without the means to take care of the
children. Unemployed young women consequently turn to the state for assistance and they are absorbed in the welfare system through receipt of the Child Support Grant. Key to the solution of growing welfare system is employment and education. GDSD invested in the programme for skills development of young women to ensure that the skills that they acquired, assist them to enter labour market and alternatively enter business.

The researcher is familiar with the WtW programmes implemented by the DSD. The DSD supported the researcher’s commitment to reviewing the programmes in order to gain insight into the functioning of the programmes in general.

3. Focus of the study

The main purpose of the research was to explore the perceptions and experiences of young women regarding impact of the WtW programme on their livelihoods. To reach this aim, the following secondary objectives came into play: To investigate what motivated young women participants to engage in the WtW programme. To explore what young women experienced while completing the programme; and to explore participants’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the programme regarding meeting their expectations.

It was anticipated that the research could enhance the intervention strategies implemented in the WtW programme and close the gap in knowledge that existed regarding the effectiveness of the programme in South Africa because no research has been conducted. It was hoped that the research could give understanding of whether the recipients were indeed able to exit the welfare system after they had participated in the programme or not.

3.1. Defining concepts

i) Women Empowerment

Srinivasa and Siddegowda (2015) identified different aspects of women empowerment such as social empowerment, educational, and health aspect. They explain social empowerment as education for women, health of women, mobility of women, participation of women in various fields and protection of women against gender based violence.
ii) *Conflict Theory*

Bezuidenhout (2013) explained that conflict theory articulates that poverty is created when society attempts to develop its social, environmental, economic and political spheres, certain people become vulnerable.

iii) *Social Development*

Midgley (1995, p.25) defines social development as a process of planned social change designed to promote the well-being of the population as a whole in conjunction with a dynamic process of economic development.

4. Organisation of the report

Chapter One presented the problem-situation and rationale for conducting the study. The main aim and objectives of the study were also described.

Chapter Two, the literature review, begins by setting the stage for the research and provides a context for the research inquiry. Issues such as unemployment in South Africa, the history and current practice related to social grants, particularly the CSG, and implementation of WtW programmes are covered. The theoretical framework that guided the study is also elaborated on.

Chapter Three focuses on the research method adopted for the research and provides the reader with details regarding the aims and objectives of the study, selection criteria used to recruit prospective participants, means of data gathering and analysis implemented and how ethical standards were met.

Chapter Four presents research findings and critically discusses the relevance thereof.

Finally, Chapter Five summarizes the main research findings, highlights conclusions reached and presents recommendations based on research findings.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Introduction

This chapter provides an overview of unemployment in South Africa; factors contributing to this problem-situation and how social grants are being implemented to address this challenge. It then focuses on the topic of this research study, namely WtW programme, which seek to empower unemployed citizens (specifically women in light of gender inequity) so that they can become self-reliant on a financial front. The discussion initially discusses WtW programmes being implemented on an international level, with specific attention to programme running in the United States of America (USA); the United Kingdom (UK) and Brazil. The discussion then narrows down to programmes being implemented in South Africa (SA). In conclusion, theoretical frameworks underpinning the study are presented.

SA has a long history of oppression and racial discrimination dating back from colonialism and apartheid. During colonialism and apartheid, Africans were marginalized by the ruling elites (White race), and majority of them were left destitute, and unskilled (Clark & Worger, 2016; Kanbur, 2015). The challenge persists after the apartheid government was abolished in 1994. Post-apartheid government was left with a mammoth task of uplifting the lives of South Africans and to create equity and unite the country (de Beer, Rothmann & Pienaar, 2015).

2. Unemployment in the South African context

Although efforts have been made in post-apartheid SA to reduce the vast number of unemployed black South Africans, the problem-situation still exists. In contemporary SA, high levels of inequality and unemployment in the labour market still exist (Anand, Kothari & Kuma, 2016). Poverty has many interrelated contributory factors; especially lack of education and skills development which lead to unemployment or low wages. Research findings indicate that skills development is extremely important to address these challenges (Weir-Smith, 2016).
Another factor contributing to the high rate of black unemployment in SA is that there are many foreign nationals who came to SA due to political instability in their own countries. Some of them are running the businesses while others are competing for jobs with locals. According to O’Luaghlín, Benstein, Cousins and Peters (2013), young Zimbabwean women and men, many with secondary and tertiary education, compete for work with less skilled South Africans in Limpopo or do business in the township. Leibbrandt et al. (2010, cited in Kruss & Wildschut, 2015) argue that there are fewer jobs available for those with no or low education levels, and who will find it difficult to access the South African labour market. The foreign nationals are better equipped with skills compared to many black South Africans; and they get preference from the employers because foreign nationals are not only cheaper; they are highly skilled; and employers can reduce the costs and receive quality service by employing them. This creates conflict between the black citizens and the foreign nationals; the locals accuse the foreign nationals of taking their jobs. Young people are mostly affected by unemployment compared to older people.

Graham and Mlatsheni (2015) noted that as young people get older and move into labour force, they are most likely to struggle with employment in their early 20s. The authors drew attention to the fact that young women are more vulnerable to unemployment than young men, and there are significant differences in unemployment rates by provinces in SA. There are many factors that contribute to unemployment for young people. For example, young people do not have work experience and they do not have the skills that the labour market requires. Furthermore, because young people are not trained well to secure employment and lack of career guidance in schools, the unemployment rate for first-time job-seekers in SA is unacceptably high (Cloete, 2015). However, there are other reasons that are contributing to the challenge of youth unemployment. Graham and Mlatsheni (2015) noted that in the late 1990s and 2000s, the country’s economic policy shifted to a high productivity, technology-led growth path that was intended to stimulate investment in skills development and higher wages. This shift brought some challenges as unskilled labour force could no longer be employed. One of the tools that can be used to address
this challenge is education. However, the apartheid government created different education systems for various races, and the post-apartheid state is still battling to rectify the system.

The post-apartheid education system is still not helping to prepare youth to enter the labour market, and there are many challenges in the system. Spaull (2013) explains that quality and duration of schooling that individuals receive; is directly linked with their labour-market prospects. Thus, offering an inferior quality of education to the poor, disadvantages them in the labour-market and entrenches their poverty (Spaull 2013). Class plays a key role in terms of the type of education that black South Africans get, and White people still maintain their privileges. Spaull (2013, p.438) explains that “historically disadvantaged schools remain dysfunctional and unable to produce student learning, while historically advantaged schools remain functional and able to impart cognitive skills”. Secondly; “the constituency of these two school systems is vastly different with historically black schools still being racially homogenous, and largely poor, while historically White and Indian schools serve a more racially diverse constituency, although almost all of these students are from middle and upper-class background, irrespective of race” (Badat & Sayed, 2014; Spaull 2013, p.438). Black people who have the means are able to take their children to the best schools in the country and in turn increases their chances to secure better paying jobs.

The gap between the rich and the poor keeps widening due to these challenges. It is believed that education can be used to eradicate poverty but if the obstacles in the education system are not removed; education cannot address the issue of poverty. Instead the rich will continuously reap the fruit of the best education that they receive. In South Africa, approximately 15 percent of total government expenditure is spent on education, making it the largest single line-item in the budget, (Pretorius & Spaull, 2016). There is a political will on the part of government to improve the system. However, the expenditure in education does not yield the expected results. It seems like it will take many years to rectify the system and improve the quality of education. Consequently, unemployment will continue to upsurge due to the changing nature of economy and kind of employees it required. When people fail to access the employment that they require, they seek assistance from the government. Government utilizes its social grants to assist those
who need care. Social security system was developed to address the challenges that were invented by apartheid system.

3. Social security in SA

Patel and Triegaardt (2008) and Brockerhoff (2013) pointed out that since the inception of democracy in 1994, the social security system has been refashioned to meet the country’s constitutional mandate to promote social and economic justice and to address the legacy of its apartheid past. Patel (2015) states that the domain of social security is poverty alleviation, reduction, prevention, social compensation and income distribution. She explains that the term refers to a diversity of strategies such as social assistance (non-contributory programmes funded by governments), social insurance (contributory programmes funded by employees and employers) and private insurance. Patel and Triegaardt (2008) and Brockerhoff (2013) argue that in addition to addressing this country’s legacy of inequality and discrimination, South Africa’s tax funded, non-contributory social assistance programme has been reshaped specifically to reduce income poverty and promote social development. The South African government decided to issue the social grants to help the poor to meet their needs. Although the money is not sufficient to cater for all the needs of the beneficiaries, it has lessened the burden from many families.

“Many of the poor are locked in poverty traps, with the cycle of low income, limited assets and opportunities constraining them from making the investments (in their health, education and livelihoods) to lift themselves out of poverty”, (Neves, Samson, Van Niekerk, Hlatshwayo & Du Toit 2009, p.8). The poor don’t have many choices since they don’t have the money to plan their lives well. Hence, they are unable to invest in education, and health and thus, many poor people do not have qualifications that can help them to secure stable job that they require; and on the other hand, they face many health challenges. Ultimately the poor people turn to the state for help; and state utilizes the social grants to assist them.

Brockerhoff (2013) notes that grants are awarded to a means-test and provide an important source of income to households that would otherwise face devastation. It is widely reported that
social grants are utilized to buy food and pay necessity of the family. Research indicates that social grants have contributed significantly towards the reduction of poverty levels in South Africa (Altman & Boyce, 2008; Dubihlela, & Dubihlela, 2014; Satumba, Bayat & Mohamed, 2017).

Neves et al., (2009) and Brockerhoff (2013) state that in the democratically elected regime, social protection has had to accommodate deep and widespread African poverty, underpinned by continuing structural factors and inequality of the South African distributional regime. The social grants were predominantly allocated to white population during apartheid; and post-apartheid has unified the welfare system. The number of beneficiaries have been increasing significantly over the years, more especially Child Support Grant (CSG). Initially; the grant was intended for younger children below ten years of age but it has been extended to children of 18 years. Neves et al. (2009), Hochfeld and Plagerson (2017), Patel and Triegaardt (2008) and Brockerhoff (2013) pointed out that recipients are overwhelming female; mostly African and have lower levels of education and cannot access employment than non-recipients. The recipients of the social grants have limited chances to leave the welfare system due to barriers that they have such as lower educational level. The recipients of social grants require to be empowered not only financially but with skills that can help them to be independent.

Neves et al. (2009) and Altman and Boyce (2008) argue that there is now strong evidence that the expanding system of social grants has played an important role in alleviating poverty in SA. The social grants are not utilized only on beneficiaries and their needs, it is also benefiting the family members. Due to lack of income within many families, the social grants are the only income, and feed the whole family. Altman and Boyce (2008) explain that there is a growing concern that unemployed family members are depending on grants that are meant to target children, the aged or disabled. Family members are responsible to take care of the needs of grant beneficiaries; however, if they are unemployed it is understandable why they divert resources away from grant beneficiaries. There are limited alternatives; and grants can be the only source of income available for many families.

4. The child support grant
In SA, only 60 percent of all households obtain income by means of any kind of work, while 40 percent of households obtain income by means of government welfare payments, (Schussler, 2013 cited in Meyer, 2016). Most welfare beneficiaries are unemployed and the grant could be the only source of income for them. The unemployment status of beneficiaries raise many concerns. It is not sustainable to give people grants without any plan to assist them to exit the system. Whenever the grant is terminated they might experience problems to support themselves. Patel, Knijn and Van Wel (2015) explain that the main aim of CSG is to provide supplementary income support to improve food security for the poor children, subject to a qualifying means-test which is set generously. CSG is reaching many poor children in our communities and it is making a positive impact in their lives. SA reaches over 16 million beneficiaries and make up 15 percent of government spending and 3, 4 percent of GDP, (Patel et al., 2015 & Brockerhoff, 2013). The amount of CSG is not sufficient to cater for all the needs of the children, but it is making a difference. Treasury (2017) announced that the CSG would increase by R20 to R380, 00 a month in April 2017. It is a norm that the grants are increased every year to help the beneficiaries to cope with the inflation. The amount of R380 is not adequate to raise a child, and as it is argued that it is meant to supplement income. However, the reality is that there is no income for many beneficiaries because they are unemployed.

There are many factors that contribute to young women to depend on the CSG. For instance, the lack of financial support from the biological father is one of the reasons young women depend on the grant. The absence of fathers in the lives of their children also contributes to the challenges that the women face in their lives as they are supposed to raise the children alone. Kimani and Kombo (2010) argue that family is the major source of the basic necessities of the life and health, love and tenderness, adequate food, clean water, a place and time for rest, clothing and sanitation, which is made possible by prevailing socioeconomic, environmental and sometimes political conditions. They accentuate that a family is responsible to provide for the needs of its members. What happens if the family is unable to satisfy the needs of its members? There are challenges that follow the family and the family members seek the alternatives to meet their needs. However, the responsibilities are entrusted on the fathers and mothers in the families to ensure that they provide for their families and it is not always a case that they fulfill the
expectations. In other cases, the fathers leave their families to go to the cities to search for greener pastures.

Kimani and Kombo (2010) emphasize that urbanization and modernization have played heavy burdens on families by causing influx of people especially men into cities in search for better livelihood. As a result, the families are left in the care of the females as the fathers are no longer forming part of the families. Some fathers are unable to provide for their families financially; and emotionally they are also unable to be available for to their children. Budlender and Lund (2011 cited in Patel, Knijn & Van Wel, 2015) accentuate that country’s legacy of apartheid and migrant labour resulted in disruption and fragmentation of families, high rates of absent fathers and large numbers of children living apart from their parents. The mothers of the children are the one who carry the burden of raising the children alone, and the families tend to experience many challenges in the absence of the fathers. Some fathers continue to support their families financially while others don’t.

Mothers who are not getting financial support from their partners turn to state for help. The state provides help in the form of CSG for biological mothers. Social grants play a key role in addressing poverty in SA. However, the social grants alone are not sufficient due to the needs of the children and families. Since social grants are dominated by young women, it is important to empower women to be independent and self-reliant.

5. Women empowerment

There are many definitions of women empowerment but these definitions help us to understand the concept well. Srinivasa and Siddegowda (2015) identified different aspects of women empowerment such as social empowerment, educational, and health aspect. They explain social empowerment as education for women, health of women, mobility of women, participation of women in various fields and protection of women against gender based violence.

They argue that women education plays an important role in the social development of the country. For instance, it is argued that if you educate a woman, she uplifts her life as well as the
quality of life of her family. They emphasize that at national level some issues such as infant mortality; blossoming population gets reduced if women are educated. Health aspect includes food, nutrition, life expectancy, sanitation, and growth of a girl and women (Srinivasa & Siddegowda, 2015). Some of the important factors that influence the health of women are reproductive health, malnutrition, awareness of available medical assistance and psychosocial factors. It is crucial for the women to be educated about these health issues so that they can manage their health well.

Kabeer (1999 cited in Patel et al., 2015) defines women empowerment as a process by which those who have been denied the ability to make choices acquire such ability. The ability to make choice have different dimensions, the first dimension refers to resources which could be of material or economic nature, as well as human and social resources which may be acquired through state, family, market and community. Second dimension refers to agency and the power to set one’s goals and act upon them. The empowerment of women involves removing all obstacles that might prohibit women from achieving their goals and becoming whatever they choose. According to Patel et al. (2015) majority of the CSG recipients who were interviewed in the research felt that they had power to manage their lives, half of them said that they are financially independent, while almost two-thirds of the women reported that they could make decisions in the interest of the children. The CSG plays an import role in empowering women and it helps them to plan their lives better.

Patel et al. (2015) emphasize that female care-givers that receive CSG appear to have more decision-making power on financial issues as well as on issues related to the children’s well-beings. Women have the responsibility to make budget for their families and to ensure that they take care of the needs of their families. They need resources to be able to perform this function and the grant assists them to fulfil this duty. However, the CSG is not sufficient to cater for all the needs of the families. It is a challenge that state is aware of and has developed the programme to address the problem. Welfare-to-work programme is the programme that was created specifically to address the challenge.
WtW programme aimed to empower the young women with skills that can help them to get jobs and start their own businesses if they choose to take the route of business. Furthermore; there is an option for those who choose to further their studies at tertiary level. Therefore; participants have many options within the programme and it depends on how they perceive the programme. The focus will turn to WtW programme from different countries.

6. International welfare-to-work programmes

6.1. WtW Programmes in the USA

The USA and UK have a long history of implementing WtW programme. These countries have had a huge influence in other countries around the world, including SA, and it is against this backdrop that these countries were chosen. It is thus important to focus on these two countries first before focusing on the WtW programme in Brazil and finally in the South African context. Focus will be on Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC), which was succeeded by Temporary Assistance to Needy Families (TANF) in USA.

The AFDC programme has been aiding poor American families which are mainly single mothers and children for almost sixty years (Midgley, 2001). Page and Larner (1997) pointed out that the programme was created to aid children whose parents could not financially support them, about two-thirds of AFDC recipients were children. Moffit (2003) and Page and Larner (1997) accentuate that needy children were defined as having been deprived of parental support or care because their father or mother is absent from home continuously, is incapacitated, is deceased, or is unemployed. They further alluded that federal legislation required states to provide cash assistance to all eligible families and only very poor families composed of single mothers and their children qualified for AFDC. Dear (1989), Page and Larner (1997), and Moffit (2003) pointed out that in addition to cash grants, many families enrolled in AFDC received other benefits such as Medicaid, child care assistance, food stamps, and subsidized housing through a variety of related programmes. Moffit (2003) notes that although the language of the legislation
was gender-neutral, in practice the clear majority of families of this type consisted of a mother and her children, or what are today called single mother families.

This programme was criticized by politicians who are pro liberal policies. Dear (1989) states that they said it is generous, expensive, and ineffectual, and it is welfare for mothers with children. He states that conservatives claim it squanders public taxes and fosters dependency, and liberals maintain it is primitive and stingy. The programme was subject to scrutiny and welfare reform was debated among the policy makers. Those who are pro liberal policies failed to understand that the programme was intended to remove people from welfare system and to create self-independency. Furthermore, the welfare-to-work programme seeks to reduce the cost of welfare and it could be done only by investing in skills development of welfare recipients.

Midgley (2001) emphasizes that in the 1980s efforts to reduce social spending strengthened and attention was focused on social assistance programme. They were various initiatives that were created to deal with the challenge, among other things steps were taken to promote employment for welfare recipients. Midgley (2001) accentuates that in the late 1980s, the new legislation expanding existing job training and employment placement programmes for welfare recipients was introduced. However, Midgley notes that participation in new programme remained low and the numbers receiving welfare benefits increased. On the other hand, he emphasized that economic conditions deteriorated in the late 1980s. These are some of the factors that instigated the welfare reform in United States. The main aim was to reduce the costs and it led to abolishment of the AFDC programme in favour of TANF. Moffit (2003) states that most important restructured elements of TANF are as follows: the devolution of major programme design elements, and financing through block grants, to the individual states, the imposition of strict work requirements to qualify for federal aid, and lifetime limits on number of years of benefit receipt which could be paid out of federal funds. The new programme emphasizes the value of employment for the recipients and aimed to help them to be self-sufficient.

Pavoni, Settees and Violante (2016) state that the objective of WtW is to provide income support and at the same time promote economic self-sufficiency through work. The designs of these programmes differ from one state to another depending on what the programme wishes to
achieve, (Greenberg & Robins, 2010). Greenberg and Robins (2010) argue that WtW programmes are made with expectations that these services will increase participants’ employment success both by assisting their search events and by bettering their general skills levels. Greenberg and Robins (2010, p.1) accentuate that ‘many studies examining WtW programmes treat the programme as a single entity, when in fact these programmes typically consist of a variety of different sub-programmes providing training such as; basic education, job preparation and search assistance, and or vocational and on-the- job training’. Pavoni et al. (2016) explain that different programmes were implemented across USA over time; some programmes are more focused on assisting individual job search, others on education and training, and others on moving the individual as soon as possible into some form of work. Hamilton (2012) clarifies this position by stating that there are three strategies or approach used by WtW programme. The job-search first approach emphasized immediately assigning people to short-term job-search activities with the aim of getting them into labour market quickly. Secondly, education-or-training first approach emphasized basic or remedial education, General Educational Development (GED) preparation, and to a lesser extent, vocational training before steering participants toward the labour market. The third approach is the mixed approach which mixed job-search first approach and education-or-training approach. These strategies create variety within the programmes and it depends on the belief and resources because job-search first could be cheaper than education-or-training approach. More resources are required to implement education-or-training approach and when it is completed recipients still have to search for jobs.

Greenberg and Robins (2010) pointed out that conflicting findings have prompted an action debate over whether strategies designed to provide more intensive training opportunities versus those intended to help welfare recipients get into jobs quickly are more effective in issuing welfare recipients labour market success. Barnow and Gubits (2002 as cited in Dyke, Heinrich, Mueser & Troske, 2009) argue that longer term, more intensive training strategies appear to be considerably more effective than short term, work first strategies. According to Bloom and Michalopolous (2001 as cited in Dyke et al., 2009) and Walker, Greenberg, Ashworth and Cebulla (2003) the most effective programmes combined employment focused and education/training strategies, with some flexibility allowed in determining the appropriate mix of these approaches for a given individual. The programmes as articulated are diverse and tend to
focus on different aspects of developing the participants. It seems like these approaches are effective because there are informed by individual needs and the needs determine how participants are placed.

In Missouri, individuals who fail to participate in required programmes face sanctions that reduce their payments generally with 25 percent but are permitted to continue receiving these reduced benefits until the five years of eligibility is exhausted, (Greenberg & Robins, 2010 and Cancian, Klawitter, Meyer, Rangarajan; Wallace & Wood 2003). However, in North Carolina those who fail to cooperate can have the full amount of their benefits withheld. In both Missouri and North Carolina individuals who work a minimum number of hours are exempted from participation in work component activities. As a result, those who participate may be individuals whose labour market opportunities are particularly limited or who are facing an extended streak of bad luck (Greenberg & Robins, 2010).

According to Pavetti, Olson, Pindus, Pernus and Isaacs (1996) some of the WtW programmes are comprehensive and are able to address many challenges that are faced by the participants. The recipients are recruited to partake in the programme and the recruitment and assessment is done prior to the intake of recipients. Pavetti et al. (1996) accentuate that the staff members of the centre visit the people in their houses and informed them through the children from schools and they conduct the awareness to community members about their programme. Pavetti et al. (1996) state that assessment of participant’s strengths and weaknesses to employment starts during the orientation and 80-hour life skills class leads to enrollment in the GED programme or educational components. Pavetti et al. (1996) emphasize that both orientation and life skills classes are designed at motivating recipients to participate in the programme and work towards becoming self-reliant. The recipients are well prepared in advance to ensure that when they finally search for the employment they are prepared. However, some of the recipients are unable to overcome their weaknesses and they require more support.

As indicated earlier USA take diverse approaches to the design of WtW programmes. Pavoni et al. (2016) explain that New York is one of the most generous states and at the same time is one of the states that is most willing to tolerate inactivity from its welfare recipients, and Illinois is
much less generous and bases its programme largely on work requirements. The government was unable to observe the unemployed agent’s job search effort (Shavell & Weiss 1979 as cited in Pavoni et al., 2016) and new ideas were developed to change the old framework in order to analyze the best design of welfare programme and trade-offs among the available policy instruments and additional technologies was introduced besides job search. The use of technology has made the interaction between the welfare recipients and the state easier and the process is managed much better. The WtW programmes are evolving and the use of technology is bettering the process of development of participants and the information of participants is easily accessed.

To model work based and job search assistance policies two technologies were introduced in the economic environment. (Pavoni et al., 2016, p.162) state that “first a secondary sector production technology that is less productive than the primary one used in market-sector job but that, as the latter, requires effort yield output”. They use this technology to capture the fact that work-based activities employ the welfare recipients in basic tasks with very low value added, usually in government agencies, non-profit institutions, or community service organizations. Secondly; an assisted job search technology allows the unemployed to accept their job search to an agency at a cost. This technology frees up time from search to either work or rest. The authors interpret the use of secondary production technology alone as mandatory work, and the joint use of this production technology and assisted search as transitional work. The participants can use the technology on their own without any challenges. Furthermore; soft programme don't use any kind of punishment or sanctions on the recipients. The best unemployment insurance contract dictates that the promised utility should fall along with unemployment spell, when the worker fails to find the job, (Pavoni et al., 2016). The technology that is used in these WtW programmes make it easy for the participants to search the job on their own and government can trace their efforts.

It is important to explore what really influenced the welfare recipients to participate in these programme or not. Lansberry, Taylor and Seale (2017) explain that in North Carolina, region, gender and racial demographics, and politics all affect work first participation among the eligible poor. Furthermore, they argue that instead of 'culture of poverty' the USA has what they call a
'culture of conservatism' in which eligible families are discouraged for participating in welfare programmes. They found that in North Carolina regions that are more urban have higher proportions of the eligible recipients being served. In addition; the African American families are more likely to use WtW programmes services, despite higher rate of sanctioning, lower provision of support services and lower employment rates (Cheng, 2009; Fording, Soss, & Scram, 2011 as cited in Lansberry et al., 2017). Finally, Lansberry et al. (2017) argue that the historical discrimination and the racialization and stigmatization of welfare programmes serve as a reminder of the culture of conservatism in the United States. Therefore, all these dynamics contribute to the decisions of the welfare recipients to participate in the WtW programmes or not.

However, some scholars identified the weaknesses in the new WtW programme. This programme limits opportunities for recipients, mainly women to participate in postsecondary education while receiving TANF funds (Finney, 1998 cited in Johnson, 2010). Furthermore, it is articulated that welfare laws prior to the new law allowed the pursuit of degrees in higher education to count as work (Cohen, 1998 cited in Johnson, 2010). Johnson (2010, p1048) ‘prior to welfare reform in 1996, tens of thousands of poor single mothers quietly accessed postsecondary education to become teachers, lawyers, social service providers, business and civic leaders, and medical professionals’. The new laws focused on work and it disadvantaged the participants who are willing to further their studies. There are many lessons that can be learned from USA programmes because there are diverse and continuously evolve. UK WtW programmes were prompted by USA and now the focus turn to UK WtW programme.

6.2. WtW Programmes in the UK

The welfare system in the UK started to introduce programmes in 1997 and New Deal became the first programme, which was replaced by Flexible New Deal (FND) in 2008. Flexible New Deal was replaced by Work Programme (WP). Firstly, the focus will be on the New Deal programme, and thereafter FND will be discussed and finally WP. Zaidi (2009) and Daguerre (2010) elaborated that specific labour market programme were established under New Deal. Daguerre (2010) pointed out the following programmes: New Deal for Lone Parents, New Deal for Disabled People, New Deal for 50 plus and the compulsory New Deal for Young People and the long-term unemployed.
All these programmes were targeting people who were in receipt of benefits from state. Rees, Whitworth and Carter (2013) argued that New Deal for Young People was mandatory scheme that offered no fifth option for those refusing to participate whilst those considered to have legitimate reasons for not working. These various programmes had different conditions for beneficiaries depending on whether they could work or not. Those who could not work due to severe disability or ill health were exempted from undertaking employment. In common across all the New Deals however; was a clear emphasis on supply-side measures and a ‘work first’ strategy of propelling working-age welfare recipients back into the labour market as swiftly as possible (Peck & Theodore, 2000 cited in Rees et al., 2013). The New Deal package for young people and long-term older unemployed workers aimed to improve employability, the capacity to get access to work, to stay in employment and to move on to better jobs through offering individualized support and a set menu of options, all including work experience and training (Millar, 2000).

Bambra, Whitehead and Hamilton (2005) state that employment such as the 1997 New Deal for Disabled people have put people with disabilities at the centre of the current UK government’s WtW strategy. These WtW programmes are either directed at individual or the environment. Bambra et al. (2005) found that three strategies focus on individual with disabilities or chronic illness by aiming to raise their education and vocational skills level, providing support and advice in locating and obtaining work, or overcoming financial concerns about the benefits-to-work transition. Secondly, Bambra et al. (2005) accentuate that the other two strategies deliberate on the work environment offering incentives to employers to employ people with chronic illness or disability and by improving the physical accessibility of the workplace environment. Deeming (2015) stated that in British social policy terms, the New Deal schemes represented a radical ideological departure from the traditional role of social security, which had focused on redistributing provisions to support those without work. The New Deal focused on removing people from welfare system to work.

In 2008 New Deal was replaced with the FND (Daguerre, 2010). Under FND all Jobseekers Allowance claimants faced the same conditions which involved intensified job search activity
and then a referral to an external provider if claim reaches 12 months (IFS, 2010 cited in Daguerre, 2010). To increase the number of people leaving Incapacity Benefits and returning to work Department for Work and Pensions proposed the introduction of a new Employment and Support Allowance (ESA) from 2008 to replace Incapacity Benefits (Daguerre, 2010). It also introduced the system to distinguish between people who were severely disabled and people who were temporarily unfit to work (Daguerre, 2010). Claimants of ESA except those with severe disabilities and health conditions, were required to participate in work focused interview, produce action plan and engage in work-related activities or see their benefits reduced (Daguerre, 2010). The arguments for FND were based on the belief that the needs of long-term unemployed were varied and would be better met through specialist providers (Morgan, 2009). The new programme was introduced in 2011 and was renamed Work Programme.

Jordan (2017) stated that WP is a UK workforce scheme rolled out nationally in 2011 by the Conservative/Liberal Democrat coalition government. It replaced the New Labour’s Flexible New Deal workfare programme. According to Jordan (2017) differences between two schemes are arguably empirically limited in terms of service provision. However, the WP dropped FND’s controversial compulsory work experience placements, and in theory, WP providers have significantly more leeway in independently designing programme activities (Jordan, 2017). Deeming (2015) argued that under new sanctions regime, claimants are no longer exempted from looking for paid employment (unless they are deemed to be lead carers or are deemed unable to work after a medical assessment). The welfare system in UK continued to change to fit the vision and objective of the ruling elites, and became the tool to gain political power.

Welfare reform of Cameron and his predecessors are fundamentally reworking and reimagining the nature and role of social citizenship, with potentially far-reaching consequences (Patrick, 2017). Furthermore, political pronouncements drawn up contractual, liberal ideas of citizenship as a status, which brings with it rights and responsibilities, with work-related conditionality a policy approach which explicitly ties the right to the state support to the responsibility to take steps to return to paid employment (Crabb, 2017 cited in Patrick, 2017). Instead of being claimants of benefits, as in the past, the unemployed would become jobseekers, and a main purpose of the welfare system was to help the unemployed become employable (Deeming & Johnson, 2017).
The welfare system moved away from giving benefits to the participants without making them commit to a plan that would assist them to be self-sufficient. In the future, while people had rights within the welfare state, they also had responsibilities, those rights were conditional on them fulfilling their side of the implicit social contract, which involved them actively seeking work (or undertaking training to assist that process) in order to claim benefits (Crigg & Bennet, 2009 cited in Deeming & Johnson, 2017 & Patrick, 2017). The liberals perceived the citizens who were working as hard workers and believed that the claimants on welfare should take responsibility to secure employment. The literature indicated that the welfare claimants in UK were facing some challenges emanating from the public.

There is a growing popular belief that standard of living for claimants on welfare is too high (Deeming, 2015). 62 percent of the British population believed that out-of-work benefits were too generous and promote dependency culture that is now seem to exit in the UK (Deeming, 2017). However, emerging evidence suggest that the elevated role of welfare conditionality and sanctioning has had highly damaging financial, material, emotional and health effects on those reliant on low-income social security (Dwyer & Bright, 2016 cited in Edmiston, Patrick & Garthwaite, 2017). Evidence shows how those subjected to such reforms experience stigmatized identities both as disabled people and benefit claimants, with a number of participants describing experiences of discrimination, bullying and harassment in their daily lives (Manji cited in Edmiston et al., 2017). The welfare reforms in UK indicated that it did not yield positive results in some of the participants.

It is believed that some people are not willing to be self-reliant or don’t have confidence to do so. It is against this backdrop that some proponents believe people must be pressurized to participate in programmes that empower them to be independent. Riccio and Hasenfeld (1996) argue that some proponents have the notion that citizens who depend on state aid should be indebted to participate in WtW programmes in exchange for the benefits they receive. The participation should be mandatory, and failure of which should result into certain penalties. However, Midgley (2001) argues that sanctions were not aimed to take the benefits but rather to correct the behaviour of the recipients. Riccio and Hasenfeld (1996) accentuate that mandatory participation helps to avoid the predisposition of the programme to attract those who can succeed in the labour
market without the assistance of the programme against those who need employment service the most, for instance long-term recipients without prior work experience. The mandatory nature of the programme might serve as motivation for the recipients to seek job so that they can avoid the conditions that comes with the mandatory programme.

However, there are other proponents who are totally against the mandatory programmes due to the label that it gives to the beneficiaries of state aid. Riccio and Hasenfeld (1996) emphasize that the critiques of mandatory participation believe that it is punitive in nature and the financial penalties affect the basic maintenance of the recipients and their children. Although it is not the aim of the mandatory programme to punish the recipients when the benefits are suspended, the recipients and their dependents are affected. However, there is an option of voluntary programme of WtW programme. Riccio and Hasenfeld (1996) emphasize that the proponents of voluntary programmes believe that if the recipients are given options to participate, it treats them as consumers rather than object. If the recipients are given the option to participate it allows the welfare staff to sell the programme and ultimately, they offer quality services to the recipients (Riccio and Hasenfeld 1996). However, the voluntary programmes are perceived as less serious and as results don’t enjoy the political support and hence don’t get the required resources.

There is one thing common about the welfare recipients across the literature, the majority of the recipients are women. Young women, with young children are usually in receipt of the benefits. Even though there is a shift in gender relations in the society, the child care remains mainly the function of the mothers. In SA, the welfare system is also dominated by female. Despite the fact that eligibility to the CSG is gender neutral, 96 percent of beneficiaries nationally are women, (Voster & de Waal, 2008 cited in Patel, 2012). In the same way, the beneficiaries of welfare service in Brazil are dominated by female. Pereira (2015) accentuates that a huge majority of recipients are women and the majority is non-white. The discussion now will focus on social protection system in Brazil.

6.3 Welfare Programme in Brazil
There are three historical periods of Brazilian Social Protection System, and it started in 1930. Silva and Lima (2017) and Grin (2013) said that year, a profound economic and social transformation began, with the transition from an agricultural exporting development model to a model of urban-industrial development. It is during this period when rural population relocated to the cities as industrialization was taking place, and the process came with new demands, (Silva & Lima, 2017). Grin (2013) argued that Brazilian economic development was intensified from 1970 onwards, in the context of a military dictatorship established in 1964, when development of capitalism in Brazil took on a monopolistic perspective, with internationalization and centralization, requiring from the state that it supported the infrastructure required by new demands of capital. Silva and Lima (2017) emphasize that in this authoritarian and centralizing context, social protection advanced adopting social programmes that ultimately functioned as a palliative to reduce the strong repression of the popular sectors and the working class, maintaining its function of reproducing the work force and seeking legitimation of the authoritarian regime. A certain section of population was marginalized and oppressed. Thus, Brazil has a high level of inequality between the rich and the poor. This period was followed by democratic regime after the federal constitution of 1988.

In the new regime, the services were extended to other sections of the society. Hunter and Sugiyama (2009) highlighted that Brazil’s post-authoritarian governments have extended programmes to previously excluded or marginalized individuals and have implemented new programmes aimed at ensuring the most basic levels of social protection. It is during this period when the Brazilian governments adopted a programme called Bolsa Familia (BF). It is also referred as Family Stipend Programme or Family Allowance Programme. Silva and Lima (2017) and Pereira (2015) accentuate that BF is the largest conditional cash transfer programmes in the world. BF is a programme which guarantees a minimum income, is the largest income transfer programme in Brazil, and is central to the social protection system in the country. Silva and Lima (2017) alluded that it comprises three main axes; a complement of income represented by monetary transfers to the beneficiary families, conditionalities, considered commitments to be made by families to support access to the rights to health, education, social assistance, and articulation with other programmes and actions.
According to Silva and Lima (2017) the insertion of the families in the BF occurs initially by enrollment in the Single Registry, and later the families are selected by a computerized system based on the data they informed in the Single Registry and on the Programme Rules. They explained that once the family has been selected, it receives a bank cash card called Family Stipend Card, issued by the Federal Savings Bank, sent through the post to the homes of the families selected. Da Silva (2012) accentuates that BF articulates two types, the monetary benefits, considered a compliment of the families’ income, and the non-monetary ones, resulting from the articulation with other actions. According to Da Silva (2012) and Silva and Lima (2017) the former are direct monetary transfers, aimed at directly relieving the impoverishment of the benefiting families. On the other hand, the non-monetary benefits, offer of actions and complementary programmes, aimed at overcoming the vulnerabilities of the families, emphasizing the offer of the professional qualification programmes, insertion into the labour market, and credit to stimulate entrepreneurialism, (Silva & Lima, 2017). BF is a comprehensive programme and it considers all the needs of the family and the amount of money received by beneficiary family is determined by needs which made the programme one of the best in the world. Families are not the same and therefore the amount offered to the families should not be the same.

The amount of monetary benefits paid monthly to the families is calculated case by case according to the family income and the number of people in the family. On the other hand, the types and amount of benefits attributed to each family consider the number of persons, ages, presence of pregnant women, and beneficiary family income. Thus, there is Basic Benefit paid to extremely poor families. The conditionality of BF involves schooling and health. Silva and Lima (2017) and Da Silva (2012) emphasize that beneficiary families must keep their children aged six to fifteen in school for 85 % of the annual school days and this drop to 75 % for those aged sixteen and seventeen. They must also get their children younger than seven the inoculations required by the national immunization schedule, and allow the growth and development of their children to be monitored by professionals in the national health service, (Da Silva, 2012). Da Silva (2012) accentuate that pregnant women and nursing mothers aged 14 to 44 who are beneficiaries of BF also have to agree to periodic monitoring by a health professional. It is evident that the conditionality is benefiting the families and is not oppressive.
to them. It is a responsibility that is expected from families and it is preventative and health professional can detect problems if there are any. Therefore, the conditionality does not take away the dignity of the beneficiary families.

According to Hunter and Sugiyama cited in Da Silva (2012) BF’s conditionalities increases school enrolment, and a 15-year-old girl is 21 percentage points more likely to attend school if her family receives the grant. Department of Social Development monitors the beneficiary families and depend on the information given by municipalities, and other governments departments and conduct the follow up. Da Silva (2012) emphasizes that the purpose of the follow up is to look at the reasons for non-compliance so that action-plan can be developed to follow the non-compliant families. Da Silva (2012) explained that when the first non-compliance occurs, the family receives a written warning reminding them of their commitments to the programme and the fact that compliance with conditions is linked to receiving the benefit. From the second non-compliance onwards, the family is submitted to the following sanctions: the second time, the benefit is blocked for 30 days, the third and fourth, it is suspended for 60 days, and the fifth time, the benefit is cancelled, (Da Silva, 2012).

The second largest cash transfer programme is a continuous unconditional cash benefit. According Medeiros, Diniz and Squinca (2015) the continuous Cash Benefit Programme is unconditional cash transfer to the elderly or to extremely poor individuals with disabilities. The transfers are made to the elderly or people with a severe disability, whose household per capita income is less than one quarter of the minimum wage. Medeiros, Diniz and Squinca (2015) and Costa et al. (2016) accentuate that the benefit is independent of previous contributions to the social security system and is not subject to any conditionality. All extremely poor individuals over 65 years of age, whether disabled or not, are entitled to the benefit. Medical experts carry out tests to evaluate the individual’s social situation with respect to his or disability; and the programme beneficiaries are re-evaluated every two years to ensure that their status has not change, (Costa et al. 2016 & Medeiros, Diniz & Squinca, 2015). The social spending in Brazil has increased and is benefiting the poor.
Hunter and Sugiyama (2009) argue that since 2002, Brazil has experienced a decline in extreme poverty and slight improvements in income inequality, trends credited in part to the BF. However, Da Silva (2012) argue that BF has had a bigger impact on income inequality than poverty. Tillin and Pereira (2017) argue that the programme reaches beneficiaries in 99.7 percent of 5570 counties of Brazil. Furthermore, Pereira (2015) and Tillin and Pereira (2017) state that BF includes 13.8 million families comprising 49.6 million people, or 26 percent of Brazil’s population. There is disagreement among scholars about the impact of the programme on the beneficiary families. However, clearly the programme reaches many people in the country; and there is capacity within the state to provide the services. The Brazilian case is the best innovation in terms of addressing the poverty and inequality in the society. Brazil can provide a good lesson for SA since the two countries have similar socio-economic issues.

Finally, WtW programme in SA will be discussed. WtW programme is new in SA and is only implemented by GDSD. There is no literature specifically focusing on the WtW programme in the South African context. The paper relies on two documents, conceptual framework and implementation plan of the GDSD.

7. WtW programme in SA

7.1 Overview of the WtW Programme in SA

For the past 18 years, South African government has implemented several poverty alleviation measures like Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), Community Work Programme (CWP), with social assistance being the largest intervention. As a result of increasing the child support grant eligibility to 18, the number of social grant beneficiaries has increase significantly. While acknowledging the role that social security especially child support grant has played in alleviating poverty cushioning the poor and vulnerable households from incidents of poverty and hunger, there is a lack of a proactive and deliberate strategy to link social grants beneficiaries to opportunities for economic activity.

The aim of the programme is to support various beneficiaries of welfare who are exiting the system like CSG caregiver, foster care beneficiaries, victims of gender based violence,
recovering substance abuse service users, women exiting victim empowerment shelters, beneficiaries exiting child justice system, and all other beneficiaries to transit from welfare into the world of self-sustenance. The programme nurtures the participants for a period of three years, based on their assessment and educational profile, individual will be linked to education and training programme that aim at ensuring that finally they are able to move themselves out of social security system.

It takes three years to complete the programme and there are five phases of the programme. Phase I the conceptual framework aims to update and refine the existing concepts to reflect the changes in assumptions, changing training requirements and the changes in economic environment that have occurred after the project charter was first developed. The overall objective of this phase is to create a sound foundation for future implementation of the welfare-to-work programme based on local consistent and international experience. Phase II is the boot camp which is a five-day intensive workshop, which introduces the participants and prepares them for world of work. The objective is to enable the participants to appreciate that they can succeed in life on their own, to enable the participants to understand themselves and to let them understand the world of work.

The phase III is done after the boot camp, and the participants are place in Non-Governmental Organisations (NGO) for the period of three years. A placement allowance is paid to the participant monthly in arrears as long as they are in the programme. The objective is to allow participants to work closely with someone in the workplace, and to identify participants’ interests, strengths and areas of work life for development. Phase IV deals with the skills training and development and career support for participants while they are placed in a work environment, and the training is provided to them. Exposure in the workplace contributes to networking of the participants, it helps participants to take up better employment opportunities during and after project life cycle. The objective is to provide participants with appropriate skills level and to enable participants narrow their career choice down. Phase V is the closure phase which includes the administrative closure and development of project post implementation evaluation report and lessons learned. The objective is to finalise any financial issues like labour
settlement, contract reviews, to collect and complete relevant records, to document the challenges and their resolution.

GDSD enters into an agreement with the managing Non-Profit Organisation (NPO), and GDSD covers the programme costs, while managing NPO ensures that it recruits beneficiaries, identify training service providers for education, and training and finally link beneficiaries to economic opportunities. The purpose of this project is to provide a structured and effective intervention through customized training and skills development support to beneficiaries placed in a work environment. The participants are recruited from Development Centres in their communities by managing NPO which is Godisang Development; and the organization accessed their Curriculum Vitaes (CVs). The participants are invited to the interview and thereafter they are informed if the interview was successful. The participants sign the contracts with the organisation and once the contract is signed; it pays the stipend throughout the period of the programme. Godisang Development is the NPO which is based in Midrand in Johannesburg. It is focusing on developing the youth; and training them and assisting them to get employed. Godisang Development is recruiting participants in all five regions of Department of Social Development. It signs Service Level Agreement (SLA) with Department of Social Development and provided the service to the participants of the programme.

7.2 Selection of candidates to complete the programme

The participants who are chosen to participate in the programme are supposed to be between 18 and 24 years of age. The social status of the participants must be the poorest of the poor based on household profiling from GDSD. The participants must have passed matric and be willing to take a post matric qualification or course. The participants must be ready to look and take a job. All these criteria must be met for participant to be selected for boot camp and the programme. The programme is targeting youth and seeks to help the youth to develop skills that are required in the labour market.

WtW programme in USA, UK, Brazil and SA targeted different people within the society. USA focuses on all recipients of welfare aid and participation in WtW programmes is mandatory. On the other hand, the WtW programme in UK targeted the people with disabilities, and those who
are unemployed; and participation is also mandatory. Brazil focuses on the citizens who are experiencing poverty and those who are in extreme poverty; and benefits are linked with conditionalities. In South Africa WtW programme targeted the youth who are in receipt of different grants more especially CSG and participation is not mandatory but rather the willingness is important. The paper will now focus on the definitions of concepts and theoretical framework guiding the study.

8. Theoretical framework

Two concepts/theories would form the framework for this report, namely the Conflict theories and Social Development.

8.1 Conflict theories

Bezuidenhout (2013) explained that conflict theory articulates that poverty is created when society attempts to develop its social, environmental, economic and political spheres, certain people become vulnerable. These theories helped us to understand the South African case of apartheid. The apartheid system favoured the Whites and deprived Black African the equal opportunities to the resources. For instance, blacks were offered inferior education, and were offered unskilled work and consequently they were impoverished. On the other hand, White people could access quality education, and skilled work was reserved for them. White people could control the economy of the country and controlled other races.

Patel and Triegaardt (2008) accentuated that apartheid was a system of institutionalized racial discrimination and all economic, political and social policies were fashioned to give effect to this policy. Africans were sidelined during that period and two decades later they continued to be disadvantaged by the system. They were unskilled, unemployed, and poverty among Africans was very high. In addition, the welfare system was dominated by Africans and female recipients. Welfare-to-work programme is the programme that could be used to deal with these challenges that were created by the system. African women are mostly affected by poverty and did not have the opportunity to develop necessary skills that are required in the labour market.
The basic argument of conflict theory was that opposition between various groups in society causes poverty (Bezuidenhout, 2013). Bezuidenhout (2013) explained that there were those who have and want to maintain their wealth, power, privileges and other social rewards at all costs. The capitalist system is known for creating the inequalities and poverty within the societies. Those who are wealthy want to maintain their status in the society and thus they control the resources. Patel and Triegaardt (2008) pointed out that the right to equality is designed to protect or advanced persons or categories of persons who were disadvantaged or discriminated against in the past on grounds of race, gender, age, disability or ethnic or social origin among others. The post-apartheid government has responsibility to address the injustices that were created by the previous government. It is against this backdrop that democratic government should develop the welfare recipients to ensure that they exit the system and become self-sufficient.

8.2 Social development welfare approach

Bak (2004) states that in SA at least half of the black population lives in poverty. The post-apartheid government is thus faced with the challenge to uplift the lives of its people and had to choose policies that can make a difference in the whole population. Department of Social Development made the decision to adopt the developmental welfare approach after 1994. What is the developmental approach; and developmental social theory will assist us to understand this approach.

Midgley and Tang (2001) argue that the notion of developmental welfare is rooted in the vintage beliefs about social progress, the desirability of change and the prospect of social improvement. In other words, the developmental welfare aims to improve the conditions of the citizens through the social programmes that improve their capabilities. Midgley and Tang (2001) explain that these programmes sought to promote popular participation in productive development and development projects in order to raise incomes and meet social needs. Midgley (1995, p.25) defines social development 'as a process of planned social change designed to promote the well-being of the population as a whole in conjunction with a dynamic process of economic development'. People who are in receipt of social grants are increasing every year and it has
created a concern in South Africa. Social grants are one of the strategies used to alleviate poverty; however, it is failing to eradicate poverty. WtW programme is the programme designed to empower the recipients of social grants with skills that could help them find jobs.

Midgley and Tang (2001) proposed the adoption of three primary axioms. Firstly, they urge the creation of organizational arrangement at the national level that harmonise economic and social policies within a comprehensive commitment to sustainable and people-centred development (Midgley & Tang, 2001). They said the implementation of the social development approach requires that economic development and social service agencies work more closely together within a unified development framework. Secondly; Midgely and Tang (2001) said the advocates of the social development approach urge the adoption of macroeconomic policies that promote employment and attain people-centred economic development outcomes. The economic growth should not benefit only few but rather the whole population and the proponents of the social development were critical about the neoliberal economic policies that tend to impoverish the citizens.

Thirdly Midgley and Tang (2001) argue that the proponents of social development approach urge that social programmes be investment oriented or productivist by promoting economic participation and generating positive rates of return to the economy. According to them a social programme is productivist if it focuses on material needs, invests in what (Sen 1999 as cited in Midgley & Tang) calls human capabilities, promotes effective participation in the economy and contributes positively to economic development. They argue that the developmental welfare requires a strong role of the state, not only in social welfare but in promoting economic development as well. Therefore, the developmental social welfare approach helped us to understand the WtW programme and we were able to see if indeed it was able to improve the well-being of its participants. Developmental welfare theory was relevant in this study because it helped us to understand how WtW programme empowered the participants to be active participants in the economy.

9. Conclusion
This chapter focused on how the practice of apartheid in SA contributed to poverty experienced by a huge number of black SA. It highlighted the negative impact the current rate of poverty and unemployment affects the social functioning of the black population. One means of addressing impoverishment, namely WtW programmes formed the central discussion point, firstly on an international basis and then specifically in the South African population. The procedures followed to implement them were also discussed. Finally, the theoretical frameworks underlining this study were highlighted.
CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

1. Introduction

This chapter initially presents the main research question and primary aim and objectives forming the foundation of the study. Thereafter, the research approach adopted and research method used to conduct the study is focused on. A description of the target population and sample of participants purposively selected are also described. At the end of the chapter, steps taken to enhance the trustworthiness of research findings and to ensure research ethics were upheld when conducting the study, are discussed.

2. Research question

This study was based on the following research question:

• What are the perceptions of young women who completed the WtW programme in the Johannesburg region, regarding the impact it has had on their livelihood?

3. Primary aim and secondary objectives

3.1 Primary aim

The primary aim of the research is to: Explore the perceptions of young women who completed the WtW programme in the Johannesburg region, regarding the impact it has had on their personal livelihood.

3.2 Secondary objectives

3.2.1 To investigate what motivated young women participants to engage in the WtW Programme.

3.2.2 To explore what young women experienced while completing the programme.
3.2.3 To explore participants’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the programme regarding meeting their expectations.

4. Research approach and design

De Vos, Strydom, Fouche and Delport (2006) and Henning (2004) accentuate that the aim of qualitative research design is to understand and interpret the meaning that research participants give to their everyday lives. The qualitative research approach was chosen because of the nature of the research goals. The researcher wanted to explore in-depth the perceptions and experiences of the participants. The researcher wished to explore participants’ personal experience of completing the WtW programme and to explore the perceptions of the participants about the impact of the programme on their lives.

The case study qualitative design was used to conduct the research. The case study method of qualitative research is based on a constructivist paradigm. Baxter and Jack (2008) accentuate that constructivists claim that truth is relative and that it is dependent on one’s perspective. “Therefore, this paradigm recognises the importance of the subjective human creation of meaning, but does not reject outright some notion of objective”, (Baxter & Jack 2008, p.545). According to Yin, (2003, as cited in Baxter and Jack, 2008, p.548) “an exploratory case study is used to explore those situations in which the intervention being evaluated has no clear, single set of outcomes”. De Vos et al. (1998, p.80) explain that the case study method involves systematically collecting and analysing data within a specific context. The context in which this study was place was in Gauteng where WtW programme was initiated. However, the focus was on the young women who completed the programme in Johannesburg region. The context within which this study took place was a specific WtW programme implemented in Johannesburg and completed by several young women who graduated in March 2017. Their personal perceptions of how this programme impact on their livelihoods had been explored.

5. Research population and sample

According to (De Vos et al., 2002, p.200), “the size of the sample will be influenced by the relative homogeneity or heterogeneity of the population”. The population in this study was all
women who had completed a WtW programme. There were 150 participants who were recruited to take part in the programme, and all of them were young women. The participants were selected from five regions of GDSD and the number was not equal. The participants were in receipt of different social grants such as CSG, and foster care grant. However, most participants were recipients of CSG. Johannesburg region contributed twenty participants and all of them were in receipt of CSG. The sample of participants was selected using purposive sampling. A purposive sampling process took place; the selection criteria being women who had completed a specific WtW programme in the Johannesburg region. Yin (2004) asserts that the role of purposive sampling is to involve those that will yield in-depth and the most relevant information. Furthermore, purposive sampling is based entirely on the judgment of the researcher, in that a sample is composed of elements that contain the most characteristics, representative or typical attributes of the population (De Vos et al., 2002).

Nine participants were selected to participate in the research. All nine participants took part in the programme because they were in receipt of the CSG. All participants were also over the age of 18 years. The officials of Department of Social Development assisted the researcher to recruit prospective participants and they were interviewed on the premises of the said department. Five participants were interviewed in the Department of Social Development office in Johannesburg. It was the office of one of the supervisors who was also involved in the programme. Three participants were interviewed in the house that belonged to one of the participants. They were interviewed individually; and others waited outside; and there was a break in between. One participant was interviewed in the car of the researcher in the park. Unfortunately, although the researcher hoped to interview 10-15 participants, only nine agreed to participate in the study.

6. Research tool and pre-testing thereof

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with participants to gather data. De Vos et al. (2005) state that semi-structured interviews usually involve a clear list of issues to be addressed and questions to be answered, but there is more flexibility around the sequence in which they are asked and the interviewer allows the respondent to speak more broadly about the topics being discussed. Semi-structured interviews helped the researcher to reflect on the answers that the participants offered and shape the focus of the discussion. Similarly, the participants could ask
for clarity whenever the questions presented to them were not clear. The interviews lasted for approximately one hour; and there were six questions asked.

De Vos et al., (2005) assert that semi-structured interviews are especially suitable where one is particularly interested in complexity or process, or where an issue is controversial or personal. The semi-structured interviews were more relevant because the researcher could explore deeper into relevant issues. Babbie (2007) states that semi-structured interviews allow exploration of topics and it helps to yield rich information that is not easily obtainable in any other way. Semi-structured interviews allowed the researcher to explore the subject in-depth and understanding was developed from participants’ perspective.

The research tool was pre-tested with two individuals who participated in the programme and met the selection criteria. However, data collected from the pre-test was not incorporated in the data collected from the nine participants. The instrument was pre-tested to establish whether the questions were clear, not ambiguous and elicited the appropriate information to achieve the objectives of the research study. This also allowed the researcher to determine whether the estimated duration of the interviews was correct.

7. Data analysis

The thematic analysis method was chosen as a method to analyse the data. Thematic analysis is described as a method for identifying, analysing and reporting patterns (themes) within data (Braun & Clarke, 2006 cited in Vaismoradi, Turumen & Bondas, 2013). The data was classified according to the themes that were identified in the responses of the participants. The themes helped the researcher to understand the views of the participants.

8. Trustworthiness of the study

According to Morrow (2005, p.250) ‘qualitative research, ensuing from a variety of disciplines, paradigms, and epistemologies, embraces multiple standards of quality, known variously as validity, credibility, rigour, or trustworthiness’. It is critical to ensure that study adheres to
required standard of qualitative research. The following will be discussed credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability of the study.

8.1 Credibility

Lincoln and Cuba (2000, cited in Morrow, 2005, p.252) defines credibility “as the idea of internal consistency, where the core issue is how we ensure rigour in the research process and how we communicate to others that we have done so”. Morrow (2005) argues that “credibility can be achieved through prolonged engagements with participants, consistent observation during field research and the use of peer debriefs”. In addition, credibility establishes whether or not the research findings represent plausible information drawn from the participants’ original data and is a correct interpretation of the participants’ original views (Graneheim & Lundman, 2004 cited in Anney, 2014).

The themes were drawn from the data that was collected from the interviews and the researcher analyzed the data and the interpretation was guided by his understanding. The participants’ voices were recorded with their consent and ‘heard’ through verbatim quotes. The quotes were utilized to support the themes and developed understanding. Furthermore, the researcher also used the expertise of academics to reflect on data gathered and analysed.

8.2 Transferability

“Transferability refers to the extent to which the reader is able to generalize the findings of a study to her or his own context and addresses the core issue of how far a researcher may make claims for a general application of their theory” (Gasson, 2004, as cited in Marrow 2005, p.252). Morrow (2005) argues that transferability is realized when the researcher provides enough information about research context, processes, participants and research-participant relationship to enable the reader to decide how the findings may be transferable. Being an employee of the Department of Social Development and familiar with WtW programme, the researcher was able to format his interview guidelines appropriately. The researcher also provides details about the context of the study and information about the participants to allow the reader to reflect on the
context and transfer the information to his or her own context. The findings could probably be transferred to other programmes of the same nature.

8.3 Dependability

“Dependability deals with the core issue that the way in which a study is conducted should be consistent across time, research and analysis techniques’ (Gasson 2004 as cited in Morrow, 2005 p.252). Morrow (2005) accentuates that the process through which findings are derived should be explicit and repeatable as much as possible. Hence, in this research the researcher adhered to proven principles of conducting qualitative research and made use of research tools to collect and analyze the data. To ensure dependability the researcher did not go into the study with predetermined ideas but the findings were contextualized within certain theories and the reviewed literature.

8.4 Confirmability

“Confirmability is based on the acknowledgment that research is never objective”, (Morrow, 2005, p.252). “It is based on the perspective that integrity of findings lies in the data and that the researcher must adequately tie together the data, analytic processes, and findings in such a way that the reader is able to confirm the adequacy of the findings” (Morrow 2005, p.252). The findings were derived from the responds that were given by the participants during the interviews and the researcher tried not to influence the responses of the participants. The researcher was also never directly involved in the WtW programme prior the research study and came as an outsider. This facilitated trying to maintain an objective stance when interviewing research participants.

9. Ethical considerations

The researcher implemented the following steps to ensure that research ethical issues were appropriately addressed.
9.1 Informed consent

Neuman (1997, p.450) stated that “a fundamental ethical principle of social research is; never coerce anyone into participating, participation must be voluntary”. The participants understood what the researcher intended to do and how it would affect them and the researcher gave the participants information about his research. Neuman (1997) and De Vos, Strydom, Fouche and Delport (2011) pointed out that it is not enough to get permission from participants; they need to know what they are being asked to participate in so that they can make an informed decision. The participants in this study were informed by the researcher what the purpose of the study was all about and what this would entail. Information was provided verbally and in writing. The participants were also allowed to ask questions to get clarity on issues that they didn’t understand. The participants were also informed that they could withdraw from the study any time and that there would be no negative repercussions if they decided not to complete the interview. The participants could make their own decision and they participated voluntarily. (See appendix C).

9.2 Deception

‘Deception refers to misleading participants; deliberately misrepresenting facts or withholding information from participants’ (Struwig & Stead, cited in De Vos et al., 2011). Furthermore, De Vos et al. (2011) accentuate that deception involves withholding information, or offering incorrect information to ensure the participation of the participants when they would otherwise possibly have refused it. The researcher gave the participants correct information to ensure that they could make their own decision regarding participating in the research. The participants’ information sheet was prepared well in advance and the information was given to the participants. After the participants read the information there was a discussion to ensure that participants understood. The participants gave indication that they understood the information. There was an agreement that final report would be made available to the participants.
9.3 Confidentiality and Anonymity

According to De Vos et al (2011 p.119) ‘every individual has the right to privacy and it is his or her right to decide when, where, to whom and to what extent his or her attitudes, beliefs and behaviour will be revealed’. The researcher thus did not disclose any identifying particulars of participants to other people. Pseudonyms were used when presenting research findings. De Vos et al. (2011, p.119) argue that ‘confidentiality can be viewed as a continuation of privacy, which refers to agreements between persons that limit others’ access to private information’. The researcher ensured that he did not use hidden video cameras and gained written permission from participants to record the interviews and the participants gave consent (See Appendix A). Some interviews were conducted in the office of DSD. However; other interviews were conducted in the homes of the participants. In all places that interviews were conducted, participants enjoyed privacy.

9.4 Avoidance of harm

Babbie (2007, p.27) states that ‘the fundamental ethical rule of social research is that it must bring no harm to participants’. In the research context, the participants can be harmed emotionally when they are being reminded of experiences that inflicted pain in their lives. The researcher was sensitive to the participants and used appropriate language. The researcher also used active listening skills and observation to become aware when sensitive issues were focused on, during the interview and showed empathy in this regard. The researcher did not pressurize the participants to talk about the things that made them feel uncomfortable. The researcher had also made arrangements for counseling for the participants who may require counseling. However, this need did not arise.

9.5 Compensation

De Vos et al (2011) ‘it seems reasonable to reimburse participants for costs incurred, such as time away from work, free time spent on the project or transportation’. The participants were not
compensated for volunteering to participate in the study because the researcher interviewed the participants wherever it was convenient for them. However, there were participants who were utilizing public transport to participate in the study, and they were reimbursed in this regard.

10. Limitations

The researcher interviewed nine participants who had graduated from the programme. According to De Vos et al. (1998, p.201), “representativeness is always important when we want to generalise from the sample to the larger population”. There were 150 recipients who were participating in WtW programmes in the Gauteng province. The nine participants were just a small number of the young women in receipt of CSG who had participated in the programme. Thus, findings are transferable; not generalizable.

Furthermore, although the researcher tried to not influence participants’ responses to questions by probing issues using open-ended questions, the researcher acknowledges that his presence during data gathering, which is often unavoidable in qualitative research, could have affected the participants’ responses. It was also important to point out that participants may have given desirable answers thinking that they may be reported to department and Godisang Development organization. But, the confidentiality clauses read to the participants prior the interviews instilled confidence in them such that no information was misrepresented. Credibility in qualitative research has always been problematic where researcher bias was bound to be present. Much of the findings of this study were based on the interpretation of data by the researcher. The background of the researcher might have influenced the interpretation of the data. To deal with this challenge, the transcripts were cross-checked with participants so as to have accurate information.

The participants were still bitter that they could not achieve the most important goal of securing employment, and they were hesitant to participate in the study. A little persuasion was required to ensure that they participated. Thus, it could have compromised the quality of answers. Furthermore, the researcher realized that the double barrel questions created problems for the participants. The researcher dealt with the challenge by rephrasing the second part of the
question to allow participants to answer. It was clear that the participants could only answer the first part of the question.
CHAPTER 4

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF STUDY FINDINGS

1. Introduction

This chapter presents the findings of the research study based on thematic analysis of data gathered. It starts with presenting the profile of the participants, all of them had completed WtW programme. Thereafter the findings are structured around the objectives of the study and the themes arising are presented under each objective. Nine participants who completed WtW programme took part in the study. All nine participants completed the programme in 2017. The following table presents the information of the nine participants.

2. Profile of research participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Number of children</th>
<th>Age in years</th>
<th>Educational level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants 5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>N6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All nine participants had passed matric whilst two participants had furthered their studies after matric, one participant had a N6 in Chemical Engineering and the other had a degree in
management. It was only two participants who had two children; one was married while the other one was a single parent. Four of the participants indicated that biological fathers of the children were still involved in the life of the children. On the other hand, two participants indicated that the biological fathers denied paternity and three participants said the biological fathers disappeared when they were informed about the pregnancy. Six participants gave birth to children while they were still young. They expressed taking responsibility for a child rather stressful because they did not have adequate support and financial means available. They wanted to further their studies/acquire new skills so that they could have a way forward to reach their own goals.

Three participants were working when they were recruited to participate in the programme, and six participants were volunteering in the NGOs. They submitted their Curriculum Vitae (CVs) at the Development Centers which are NGOs subsidized by Department of Social Development in their communities, and Godisang Development organization (which is NGO contracted to manage the WtW programme) accessed their CVs and offered them the opportunity to participate in the WtW programme. In addition, Godisang advertised the WtW programme in the newspapers and five of the participants learned about the programme in the advert, and four participants learned about the programme in Development Centres. The results of the research are now presented in terms of the objectives.

3. Research findings

Based on thematic analysis of data gathered, the following themes related to the research objectives. The researcher selected quotes that are poignant and most representative of the research findings.

3.1 Objective One: to investigate what motivated young women participants to engage in the welfare-to-work programme

Research findings suggest that there were three main factors that motivated the young women to participate in the programme, namely i) the prospect of obtaining an income that was higher than
the CSG because this grant was considered inadequate to provide for the needs of their children; ii) possibility of securing permanent employment to enjoy financial security, and iii) the opportunity of furthering their education.

Theme 1: Child Support Grant inadequate to meet needs of children
Patel et al. (2016) explained that the main aim of CSG is to provide supplementary income support in order to improve food security for poor children. The issuing of the CSG is subject to a qualifying means test, which is set generously. All nine participants were in receipt of CSG, but it was considered too low to adequately meet the needs of their children. One participant was not happy about the amount of the grant.

The follow quote captures her sentiments.

Participant 4: “
It is unemployment because I thought I have a daughter to raise. Actually, I needed assistance, and the grant is not enough... maybe they (people running the WiW programme) could help me.

Theme 2: Permanent employment provides stability
Participants who were in temporary employment wanted to obtain permanent employment in order to enjoy financial security. Financial security provided a sense of surety that they would be able to provide for the needs of their children on a long-term basis. All participants were unemployed and were encouraged when they were told that the programme would assist them to get something.

Participant 8:
I wanted something for myself I did not want my child to grow the way I did. I wanted her to have a good life. I had hope, it was welfare-to-work programme. I thought when I leave the programme I will be employed and stable. That means I will be able to take care of my child and I will also have a qualification, besides what I have.

Participant 1:
I saw a post that say welfare-to-work programme, at Lulaway because at Unisa when I was working I was a contract I wanted something that was stable, and when I saw the emblem of social development funding this programme I became interested and I applied with Lulaway for the programme.

The programme was well received by these participants and they were convinced that they will get employed after they have completed the programme. They saw the programme as the ticket to employment and they thought they could get something much better and left the welfare system.

**Theme 3: Furthering one’s education opens up job opportunities**

Social empowerment of women is defined as education for women, health of women, mobility of women, participation of women in various fields, and protection of women against gender-based violence, (Srinivasa & Siddegowda 2015). Education is key in women empowerment. It became obvious during the study that the young women were determined to further their studies and the programme presented this opportunity. Most of the participants had completed matric, but were unable to further their studies. There were various factors that prevented them from studying further. For example, one participant was an orphan, and as oldest child in the family, she undertook the responsibility of taking care of her younger siblings.

Another participant wanted better life and she would acquire education to improve her qualification. Six participants were more interested to secure qualification and thereafter they could be employed. The following participants made this point of view clear:

**Participant 7:**

*What motivated me to be part of the programme is that they were talking about the positive things. Since I did not go to university because my grandparent passed away and my mother passed away, so I did not go to university. I had to take care of my siblings. That is why I wanted a job so they were saying positive things that they will take us to school and after that they will leave us. After that programme we will be employed permanently”.*
Participant 9:
“We were told that we will get qualifications, such as community development and we will learn more and get certificates. In addition, they told us about work experience and jobs”.

As far as findings related to this objective is concerned, it is noted that several overseas studies (such as the USA, Canada, UK, Australia, and New Zealand) have identified similar motivations for people deciding to participate in WtW programmes (Campbell, Thomson, Fenton & Gibson, 2016). In many respects participants in the research wanted to achieve self-sufficiency to be able to secure permanent employment and thus be able to adequately provide for the needs of their children (Breitkruz & Williamson, 2012; Taylor, Gross & Towne-Roese, 2015). The participants indicated that they were willing to improve their skills and secured qualifications that would help them get better jobs. Therefore, it appeared to participants as a second chance for those who could not manage to further their studies due to family commitments.

3.2 Objective Two: to explore what young women experienced while completing the programme

Research findings indicate that the young women completing the programme experienced several things. In general, they felt uplifted in the boot camp and regarded this aspect of the programme as meaningful. However, in some cases, participants pointed out that placements at various organizations proved to be challenging.

The two themes coming to the fore reflecting their experiences of the programme are: i) Boot camp was therapeutic and inspiring and ii) placements at organizations were purposeless and tension filled.

Theme 1: Boot camp was therapeutic and uplifting

Eight participants experienced the boot camp as therapeutic. The participants entered the boot camp with recall of many challenges they had experienced in the past and how these experiences had impacted on their lives. In many respects, they had previously not been afforded the
opportunity to resolve these personal and trying experiences. The boot camp filled this gap because there was a psychologist that was available to assist them. The participants utilized the service of the psychologist and according to them it was helpful for them. The participants could also share their experiences one with another and consequently this created awareness that there were many people who had experienced similar challenges and were in the same situation as them.

**Participant 5:**

“A good camp to find ourselves.... a lot of us.... what can I say we were dumped with kids, you know those traumas and all of that... But we learned a lot about ourselves; find ourselves and finding inner peace stuff like that”.

**Participant 6:**

At the boot camp, we learned it was reviving I will say it revived the spirit that died when you got the child. You will say now that I have the child; I will not be something you see.... At boot camp, I made friends and I had a lot of fun... there was spiritual upliftment. There were sermons of spiritual upliftment and we attended them. We were sharing rooms with other girls that were different from different regions, different languages but love was there, and there was a lot of love, there was fun and food was good”.

**Participant 4:**

“Ja, it really changed me; it gave me some experience I never got the opportunity now; it is there it helped me. Looking at life, the things that you think life is bad but when you see others you see that yours is better. When you looking at others... ja, it taught me a lot”.

At the boot camp; there were many motivational speakers who had been invited to address the participants. These workshops played a key role in uplifting the participants and they realized that it was still possible for them to rebuild their lives. Most importantly, the motivational speakers were female and these females were successful career women. They understood women
issues and could motivate them to take charge of their lives. The participants realized that what they were experiencing in their lives, they were not alone. Other people were also having difficulties. Here are some of the views expressed by the participants:

**Participant 8:**

*The boot camp was right because there were motivational speakers who were visiting us. It was top people who came to motivate us and they were women. They gave us hope, like they were showing us that we made mistakes, but those mistakes don’t define you. You must continue with life... it was good; it was a new experience. After the boot camp I was determined and I look at life differently. They showed us that you don’t have to depend on other people and just live. You don’t have to say you have nothing...you must continue to move forward.*

**Participant 9:** “It was a good experience... I did not know a lot of things. When we were there, they gave us hope and they uplifted us.

There was only participant who highlighted that she found the therapeutic and motivational aspects of the programme frustrating and meaningless. This is probably because she came with high expectations. She seemed to have been trying everything to build her career and could not follow the plans of the programme. It seemed like she did not fit well into the programme, especially because she already had a degree and work experience. The most important thing for her was to become employed. She chose to quit her previous employment because it was a contract job and she was hoping to get a permanent position. She was accepted to participate in the programme because she was in receipt of the CSG. However, it seems like the skills that she had acquired before she became part of the programme were ignored. This is what the participant has to say:

**Participant 1:**

“And when we moved here we have to find ourselves again for whatever that they were doing... so we were supposed to find ourselves... Remember I was working with kids... we had to find
ourselves after one year six months... they move us and we left with another one year six months. So, it was never properly planned”.

Campbell et al. (2016) discovered that some programmes addressed the broader problems many lone parents experienced by including methods of coping with stress, while orders offered routes to assistance for domestic abuse. Both WtW programme in SA and the developed countries acknowledged the importance of addressing the social issues or problems that participants experienced in their lives and incorporate strategies that could assist them. It proved helpful to the participants in this study. These positive experiences confirmed that the therapeutic approach to WtW programmes can have successful outcomes. Other studies highlighted that economic insecurity and involuntary unemployment pose significant risks to people’s wellbeing. Overseas findings indicated that participation in WtW can help improve resilience to stresses related to unemployment. The authors emphasize that programmes are most successful when they combine personal development, as well as skills training and employment recovery (Coutts; Stuckler & Cann, 2014).

While the boot camp was experienced as therapeutic and uplifting in this study, it is interesting to note that in some developed countries, the goal of the WtW programmes focus more on developing basic work skills, rather than taking a therapeutic stance, and this makes participants feel more confident and increases their sense of self-esteem (Campbell et al., 2016).

Theme 2: Placements at organizations were purposeless and tension filled

Four of the participants experienced challenges in the organizations where they were placed during the programme. Three participants complained that the placements were not well planned because when they arrived at the organizations they were assigned to; the organizations were not clear what roles and duties they should perform. Participants implied that it became clear to them that Godisang did not properly discuss the purpose of the placements with the organizations concerned. Thus, the organizations did not welcome the participants in their organizations. The participants commented this way:
Participant 3:

No when we were at Ipelegeng, there was conflict when we arrived. Because we knew that we were going to do social working. The social auxiliary worker told us we were at the wrong place they were not informed that we are coming to be interns at Ipelegeng. The first week or month it was rough for us because they did not know what to do with us. We were sitting there and not doing anything we were assisting people who were typing their CV, doing copies for them, and laminating their certificates. They keep accusing us that Godisang brought their problems to them.

Participant 5:

NGOs, we were more limited a lot because you will find that there is nothing to do you are more of an assistant more often, you want to get into a place whereby everybody knows there is nothing that is permanent for them you intimidate them you know what if you get employed what about me and all that. So, working for NGO there is no growth you know in terms of us learning in a working environment. There is nothing to learn there everything is more especially skills training there is nothing to learn.

Four participants highlighted that they did not feel comfortable when placed at an organization. For example:

Participant 2:

The challenge was where I was working... people used to come with their own issues and I could not understand. I thought some people have a problem with me personally, but that was not a case... they had their own issues. I learned in life you have to hassle and be strong if she is not laughing today I have to accept. When she is not laughing, it is not your problem, when she is laughing it is not your problem. It is life they have their own things.

Participant 1: “They never listen to our queries... mmm... it was never planned, for me when I check it was never planned. Because the first time when they did placement they never check what your previous background is, what are you coming to do in this programme”.

Participant 2:
Another aspect highlighted by participant was that she found the placement uncomfortable was the fact that there were already political dynamics in the organization and these created feelings of uncertainty and tension.

Participants 5:

“You get into a place whereby everybody knows there is nothing that is permanent for them...you intimidate them you know...what if you get employed, what about me and all that”.

Findings suggest that the participants were placed at organization that were not suited to their needs for development and work experience. They experienced the placements as not enhancing their ability to function as competent, responsible employees. Campbell et al., (2016) confirm that when employment opportunities available to respondents are atypically; at or near the minimum wage, physically demanding, lacking autonomy, and had limited potential for career development (Campbell et al, 2016).

3.3. Objective Three: to explore participants’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the programme regarding their expectations

Four main themes developed when focusing on achieving Objective Three, namely: i) Developing work skills in practice was poorly managed, ii) deductions from stipends inconsistent; iii) exit plans not effective and iv) educational thrust not empowering.

Theme 1: Developing work skills in practice was not well managed

Three of the participants felt that the programme was not properly planned and it failed to develop work skills in an area of employment that they were keen to enter. This was primarily because the facilitators of the programme did not explore where their employment interests lay prior to placement at various NGOs. This frustrated some of the participants:
Participant 1: Because the first time when they did placement they never check what your previous background is, what are you coming to do in this programme. For instance, they sold us lies because the programme was like you will be in this programme, study for whatever you want to be. It was a second chance for young women that have children because we never got a chance to be better people. They were giving us a second chance, they were removing us from grant. The intake when they take us, the first-time placement was to start with NGO and acquire certain skills... but if I was planning to do policing, or nursing and they placed me to NGO that deal with kids it’s not gonna benefits me for three years, so it was never properly planned.

Participant 6: The strength of the programme they were able to identify the problem that there is a problem among the youth. They have children and they don’t know where to go from here and then they took them and gave them the working experience. But working experience can be disadvantage sometimes if you don’t have qualified papers number one. I am not employable now, I will not say I am employable to the position I want to be. Anyone can be a cashier, anyone can be a cleaner but when you were part of this programme you need to be somewhere.

Greenberg and Robins (2010) argue that welfare-to-work programmes are made with expectations that these services will increase participants’ employment success both by assisting their search events and by bettering their general skills levels. The researcher is of the opinion that the programme could probably have been more successful and had a positive impact on the participants if the implementers of programme first determined the interests and skills of participants in the programme and built on them.

Theme 2: Stipend deductions inconsistent
The stipend that was paid to the participants was helping them to meet their needs and it was thus very important to them. However, two of the participants became ill while they were participating in the programme. Deductions were made in their stipend and left some of them unhappy because Godisang did not deduct the same amount. This is what the participant has to say:
**Participant 3:** “I contacted them and I informed them that I submitted the doctor’s note and they said they did not get it. But I said you are the one who said I must give it to the supervisor, and I send someone. She said I will get it in the next stipend. Come the next stipend I did not get it and she said it was not her fault and I said it is what you said how come it is not your fault. I think their mistake they were not saying the same things they kept changing, and when they change they did not inform us. If you can ask me about the deductions how much they deduct I can’t tell you because it is different. They deducted R700 for two days for me and someone will tell you they deducted R300, so it was different”.

**Theme 3: Exit plans not effective**

Three of the participants believed the facilitators of the programme should have planned their exiting of the programme more effectively. They felt that they left the programme not really knowing the way forward. These were the views expressed by two participants:

**Participant 6:** The programme is a good idea but execution was not the best execution. It required Plan A and Plan B and exit strategy for us that is okay, there is no good exit strategy. Exit strategy they failed us when they saw the programme was coming to an end they found the mentors for us. That was a waste of money you find the mentor for someone who is about to exit... they could have used that money to pay for our school.

**Participant 5:** The weaknesses let me deal with the weaknesses I think the weakness was after the programme thing you know you might start something as you start anything when you start a baby or whatever or a business you need to know where it ends before you even attempt to start that business. So, their weakness they just go along with the first you know booming or picking that took place from the business.

It seems like the mentors were introduced too late to the participants and they did not benefit much from them. The role of the mentors was not clarified or was not seen as important by participants; and there were more concerns about their education.

**Theme 4: Educational thrust of the programme is not empowering**
All participants were not happy with ‘Mila’, which is a service provider that was offering educational classes for participants. The participants found out that Mila was not registered and they had been submitting their portfolios and assignments to an unregistered company. They felt that they had wasted their time and efforts attending classes. They felt that leaders of the project failed them because they failed to confirm that service organization they were referred to was, in fact, not registered to provide the standard of education required. The participants felt that they could have informed them at the beginning of the project, and at least they could have acquired certain qualifications.

Three participants thought that courses that were offered by ‘Mila’, such as mathematics literacy and communication, did not cater for their needs. After they completed the classes, they were advised to register at institutions of their choice and the programme managers offered to pay half of the fees. Four of the participants desired further education, but they could not find ways to settle 50% of the payment for their studies. However, one participant perceived it as a way of teaching them to prioritize their stipend. These are the views expressed by two of the participants:

**Participant 7:**

*Yho we attended every Tuesday. We started with communication... we thought we were accredited after we did maths literacy. Mathematic literacy truly speaking I was not happy because I did pure mathematics. So, mathematics literacy I saw it as like I am going back. I did it anyway and I passed it and I was even participating in class. We did our portfolios and when it came to accreditation nothing happened and we called to workshop in August and it was in 2015 by August. Our accreditation will be there and we will be graduating. We were so happy but till today we are not graduating.*

**Participant 2:** *Yes, because it only pays half, if your school is R20 000, they pay R10 000 and you should pay another R10 000. They teach you how to grow up and how to budget. You must budget, you must know what is important, and you were taking it from R3600 and others were*
using that money for groceries. So, to me food was not important, what was important was education.

Hamilton (2012) alluded that in the mixed approach to WtW programme, most education services are provided by local community colleges and education is of a high standard. Furthermore, Hamilton elaborated that the programme was strongly employment focused; staff communicated that the primary goal was to help people move into jobs, and job search was the most common activity.

Hamilton (2012) also emphasized that the programme had a clear purpose; the programme aimed to put participants into employment. However, in this research, it is obvious that the service provider that was hired to provide education to participants did not meet required standards. Ethical issues came into play because the organization providing services was not registered and did not provide graduation certificates to participants who completed the course. Education could have been utilized to devise the exit plan of the participants, but there was no visible exit plan in the programme.

Campbell et al. (2016) said participation in welfare-to-work made some respondents feel they were a good role model for their children and facilitated more positive parenting. However, they argue that several studies noted that gaining employment could lead to conflict, while the parent could gain money and self-worth, less time was available to spend with children. WtW programme in the developed countries proved that it could place participants into employment and there was a clear exit plan and the programme could meet its objective. However, it could not resolve all the challenges of the participants. In this research participants complained that there was no exit plan and they could not leave the welfare system and were still unemployed. Thus, could the WtW programme really succeed in resolving the dilemma that was faced by participants? The programme managed to build the participants’ confidence and they believed that they could still succeed.

3.4 Objective Four: Investigate how participants think the programme has impacted on their livelihoods
Mixed feelings were expressed by the participants regarding how the programme impacted on their livelihoods. Positive feelings were reflected in the following themes: i) self-discovery and self-development and ii) women empowerment. However, some participants highlighted that the programme also had a negative impact on their lives. The following two themes came to the front in this regard: iii) Caught in the debt trap and iv) unemployment persist

**Theme 1: Self-discovery and self-development**

Six of the participants explained that the programme assisted them to better understand who they were. The programme facilitated self-reflection about their personality characteristics and sense of self-esteem. This enabled them to improve their sense of self-esteem: to discover and focus on their capabilities. Two participants explained that this section of the programme helped them focus on changing certain bad habits and approach life differently. Furthermore, it gave other participants the motivation to further their studies. The programme provided them with hope that their circumstances can be uplifted; that they could still change their life and plan their careers.

The following verbatim quotes highlight these sentiments.

**Participant 8:**

*It made me wanted to go to school. It gave me work experience, I thought I could not work with people but now I realized I can work with people. I was working with people at the NGO and Department of Social Development with community. I was working with community and it made me realized that I can work with people. I thought it was not for me.*

**Participant 5:**

*To start with I was very shy, I grew from this programme, I have seen being out of the shell that is what I can say that this programme gave impact, so...somebody was there thinking inside the box a lot you know, through this I have learned that I have my own capabilities in life I can do anything in life as long as I can put my mind into that I can do anything.*

**Theme 2: Women empowerment**

Neves et al., (2009, p.11) state that “in the post-apartheid period, social protection has had to accommodate deep and widespread African poverty; underpinned by enduring structural factors
and inequality of the South African distributional regime”. The participants came from the poverty-stricken families and depended on the state for a living. The participants were paid the stipend while they were participating in the programme, and it made a huge difference in the life of the participants. The participants utilized the money to assist the family members. For instance, three of them were taking care of their siblings after the death of their parents or caregiver. The participants were in receipt of CSG, which was less than four hundred rands a month, whereas the stipend was three thousand six hundred rands per month.

The programme also helped to empower young women, and it did not only empower them financially. It also gave them a sense of control over their life, and they felt proud that they were working for their money. The following participants explain how the stipend assisted them.

**Participant 6:**
*Godisang assisted me with stipend in the first place because I could live with the stipend. I could do small things at home; I mean ‘black tax’. Because at Godisang we come from different background and mostly when you check, the background of others they could afford Indian weaves, and nails but some of us especially people that I know the stipend was a means of survival.*

**Participant 7:**
*It impacted on my life because I helped my sister to like financially to attend school to each and every course that was available I will give her money to apply and go to school and then it also helped me if I did not go to this programme I will not think about going to school.*

**Participant 2:**
*No, besides the stipend there was money, I could take care of myself but it is nice to work for the money. Unlike when the man is working for you, he tells you what to do.*

**Participant 4:**
Self-empowerment... you don’t have to depend on other people you have to sustain yourself. You need to depend on yourself not others, you need to go out there and work for yourself, provide for your child and yourself not have a baby and expect daddy baby to look after the baby and yourself no.

Kabeer (1999 cited in Patel et al., 2015) defines women empowerment as a process by which those who have been denied the ability to make choices acquire such ability. It emerged that the programme gave some young women ‘power over their lives’. Even though they were still unemployed, some participants did not expect the biological father of their children to support them financially. Others had a sense of satisfaction when they earned their money through working for the stipend, and gained control over life.

Hamilton (2012) stipulated that some WtW programmes are designed primarily to provide work-based income support during cyclical periods of high unemployment. Furthermore; Hamilton (2012) elucidated that a subset is designed, not only to provide short term-income support, but also to improve individuals’ ability to get and hold unsubsidized jobs in the long term. The stipend or income support were provided to support the participants during the time of placements in order for them to continue to serve or work without experiencing complications. In developed countries, the income support is provided to participants after assessing the background of the participants. However, in SA, WtW programme, the stipend is provided to all participants, irrespective of their background. However, some participants also identified that the programme had a negative effect on their livelihood. Two themes came to the fore in this regard: Caught in debt and unemployment persist

**Theme 3: Entered the debt trap when trying to further educational needs**

One participant is struggling to pay the debt that she acquired while she registered at the college. The people who are administering the programme encouraged the participants to register and it was agreed that the participants would pay half of the fees while Godisang would do the same. The organization paid its half, but the participant was unable to settle the remaining half. Two participants could secure National Student Financial Scheme (NSFAS) loans to pay for their studies while others were paying for themselves. While two participants were still applying for bursaries to continue with their studies. The participants commented this way:
Participant 9:

“It was R41 000 and they paid half of that money. It was at the later stage of the project, they told us in 2016 if they could have told us in 2014 when we started with the project we could have managed to pay. Now I can’t pay I am in arrears of R4325”.

Participant 7:

“Yes, because the programme was ending, it ended this year in March. We could not and others we tried. Because of the mercy of God, we got NSFAS”.

Theme 4: Unemployment persist

The main aim of the programme was to remove the participants from the welfare system and help them become self-sufficient by securing permanent employment. However, all participants were still unemployed and it left them frustrated. Others regretted that they left their temporary or contract work to join the programme hoping they would secure permanent employment. They wished they could have stayed at the previous work because maybe they could have been offered permanent employment at a later stage. Three participants made the following comments:

Participant 6:

“I am still where I was before Godisang ... Sometimes I wonder if I did not quit Marotlopa I will be permanent. Because I saw Godisang as a promise when I leave here I will be something. But I am still where I was... I can still work at Pick ‘n Pay”.

Participant 1:

About the programme ... I want to know why the department is neglecting this programme, because you know they founded this programme. In their mind, what is happening to these beneficiaries? Whoever is financing this programme... must answer what is happening to the beneficiaries? From R350 to R3600 we have to go back to the grant again. Whoever started this must answer.... the same challenge that I have before I became part of the programme...so I
can’t say it has a positive impact because three years is a long time. Had I stayed at Unisa, maybe I will be permanent.

**Participant 3:**

“I don’t think they achieved their objectives. We were told that everyone who participated in the programme, when it ends, we will be working…. ‘because they promised us that they will helped us to find the jobs’.

These research findings are similar to those identified by researchers in first world countries. For example, Campbell et al. (2016) elaborate that the low income from welfare-to-work benefits or poorly paid employment led arrears in utility bills, rent payment, eviction and restrictions on the family food budget. In addition, they alluded that several studies reported that even where respondents achieved full time employment, they experienced financial insecurity, often relying on associated welfare benefits to meet employment incurred costs. The studies indicated in the developed countries that the money was not enough to meet the needs of the participants even in the presence of employment. In the researcher’s study, it was clear that the challenges that participants faced were especially related to the entering debt when trying to complete their studies and failing to secure employment. However, the programme raised their hope for the future; and they were positive that they would continue with their studies despite their challenges.

4. **Conclusion**

The benefits and costs of WtW programmes have long been debated. As Greenberg, Deitch and Hamilton (2009) aptly pointed out that whether a programme is judged as a success in terms of its benefit-cost performance depends on what policymakers were attempting to accomplish in that program. In the WtW programme completed by study participants, policy makers hoped to improve participants’ employability; to develop service-leadership mind set amongst the participants; to set participants into their career paths; to develop a self-help mind-set and to link some participants to self-employment opportunities.
In many senses, findings suggest that although the participants’ employability might have been improved, their desire for permanent, well-paid jobs did not materialize. They had hoped to secure permanent, lucrative employment but all remained unemployed after completing the programme and reentered the welfare system as a result. Furthermore, although efforts were made to help them into their career paths, they felt that they were unable to further their career because educational fees were not covered in full by the Department. They found it challenging to pay half of the fees because they did not have good incomes. However, it also became apparent that some of these objectives were realized. Participants emphasized that they did experience a change of mindset. Their sense of self-esteem improved because a strengths-based approach was adopted by the service providers. In the following chapter, the main findings, conclusions and recommendations will be discussed.
CHAPTER 5

MAIN FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Introduction

This chapter critically discusses the main findings of the study, provides a description of conclusion reached and points out recommendation based on the research.

2. Investigate what motivated young women participants to engage in the welfare-to-work programme

As the title of the programme suggests, the aim of the project is to remove the participants from welfare to work. Godisang recruited the participants; and they socially marketed WtW programme well. They informed prospective participants in the programme that the programme would assist them gain work experience and secure full-time employment. Furthermore, the participants were informed that they would be allowed to study whatever they chose. Consequently, the participants felt excited about the guaranteed outcomes. They were willing to sacrifice their time to be able to become financially independent and further their education.

3. Explore what young women experienced while completing the programme

The main objectives of the boot camp are to enable the participants to understand themselves and to appreciate that they can succeed in life on their own. This phase of the programme was positively experienced by eight research participants. They highlighted that they came away with a greater sense of self awareness and confidence that they could be successful in the employment world. After completing the boot camp, participants were placed at various NGOs to gain work experience and a placement allowance was paid to them monthly. Programme managers basically wanted them to experience and gain knowledge in the workplace and engage in productive tasks. They were supposed to take participants’ interests and strengths into
consideration when making placements. However, research findings suggest that four women experienced challenges and frustrations when completing this phase of the programme. The participants did not experience placements as stimulating; a workplace where their skills could be developed in an area of work that they wanted to be in. Inconsistency in terms of stipend payment and quality of supervision received at the different organisations was also emphasized as areas of dissatisfaction. The participants felt that the implementers of this phase of the programme should have analyzed their needs and thereafter they should have matched identified needs with the relevant placements. There should have also engaged more rigorously with managers/supervisors at the various organizations so that they could have enabled participants to work productively and obtain appropriate supervision.

4. Explore participants’ perceptions of the effectiveness of the programme regarding their expectations

Eight participants perceived WtW programme as ineffective. They had expected to be able to find permanent jobs once completing the programme, but this did not take place. They still faced a fundamental challenge; securing well-paid permanent employment. Three participants who had been in part-time employment prior to participating in the programme, regretted doing so because they reasoned they might have been able to secure permanent employment.

Three participants attributed a poor exit plan as a reason why they were not equipped to enter the working world. Although they were guaranteed that the programme would facilitate furthering their studies by covering 50% of the fees, this did not prove doable because of the poor financial circumstances they found themselves in. All participants found it difficult to readjust as far as finances are concerned because they once again became dependent on the state for Child Support grants, which were significantly lower than the stipend they had received.

5. How the programme impacted on the livelihood of the participants

The participants gained insight about their personalities while they were participating in the programme. One participant realized that she could in fact work with people, something that she
did not think she could do. The stipend had a positive impact in the lives of the participants, and it increased the family income. Although the stipend was R3600, six participants managed to pay fees for their siblings, kids and for themselves. However, when the programme ended one participant was left with debt that she accrued while studying. On the other hand, the participants managed to gained work experience in the programme. The participants failed to secure the permanent employment and remained unemployed.

6. Conclusion

Theoretically, WtW programme is good because it aims to address core issues, namely to improve participants’ employability; set participants into their career paths and develop a change of mindset so that they can enter the workplace. Unfortunately, theory is not being well integrated with practice and this limitation needs to be addressed.

7. Recommendations

7.1 Godisang Development

- It is recommended that the Godisang Development which is implementing the programme should do a thorough assessment of the needs of the participants and their skills and match their needs with relevant non-profit organization.
- Godisang Development must build a good relationship with the organizations that are utilized as placement for participants and there must be a contract between Godisang and the organizations.

7.2 Department of Social Development

- Department of Social Development must establish a bursary scheme for the participants who are willing to pursue bachelors and diplomas
- Department of Social Development should not wait for evaluation report at the end of the programme, and evaluation must be done yearly or in six months to detect the challenges.
• Department of Social Development should monitor the work of Godisang Development quarterly.
• There must be a tracking system to track the beneficiaries and their progress and ways to support them through the regions.

7.3. **Broader field of research**

• Research focusing on the strategies used to monitor and evaluate the welfare-to-work programmes and activities. This is essential because measuring progress and effectiveness in the provision of developmental social welfare services is important.
• Determine factors contributing to the effective functioning of welfare-to-work programmes in other developing countries
REFERENCES


Dear, R.B. (1989). What is Right with Welfare? The Other Face of AFDC. *The Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*, 16,2, pp.4-43


www.sassa.gov.za

APPENDIX A: CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATION IN THE STUDY

I ____________________________ (Participant’s name) hereby consent to participate in the research study that will be conducted by Mr Tani Radebe a student at the University of Witwatersrand. The study seeks to elicit “the impact of the welfare-to-work programme on the livelihood of the recipients”.

I, the undersigned am aware that:
1. My name will not be used in the research to ensure privacy
2. I am allowed to withdraw from the study any time I wish to do so and it will not affect the services I receive from Department of Social Development
3. I may decline to answer any question that I do not feel comfortable with.
4. I am aware that only the researcher and his supervisor will have access to the raw data and it will be destroyed after two years if there is publication of the study or after six years if there is no publication.
5. I am aware that there will be no direct benefit or rewards for my participation in the study.
6. If there is any emotional distress that I experience, counselling will be arranged for me.
7. I understand and give my permission for the researcher to audio-tape the interviews for data-coding purposes only.

Name of the participant ____________________________
Date ____________________________
Signature ____________________________
APPENDIX B: REQUEST FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

Research Coordinator
Gauteng Department of Social Development
Provincial Head Office: Research Unit
2001
Dear Ms Judith Demeshane

RE: PERMISSION TO CONDUCT THE STUDY AT GDSD
I am a student enrolled for Master of Art degree in (Social Development) at Wits University. As part of the course requirement, I am expected to carry out a research project. My research topic is “the impact of welfare-to-work programme on the livelihood of the participants”. The overall aim is to explore the perceptions of young women who have completed the programme regarding the impact the programme has had on their lives.

The information gathered will be documented as a research report and submitted to University of Witwatersrand (Department of Social Work) and a copy thereof will be submitted to the Department of Social Development. It is anticipated that the research findings will help Gauteng Department of Social Development to gain insight into how the programme is impacting on the lives of people completing the course, and to identify any strengths and/or weaknesses identified by research participants.

Your co-operation and assistance will be highly appreciated. I request that your response be in writing. For any queries, please contact me at 016 930 2043 or 060 712 6110.

Yours Sincerely
-------------------
Mr Tani Radebe

--------------
APPENDIX C: PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET

Good day;

My name is Tani Radebe and I am a post graduate student registered for the degree MA in Social Development at the University of the Witwatersrand. As part of the requirements for degree, I am conducting research on the impact of welfare-to-work programme on the livelihood of the participants. It is anticipated that this information may improve the programme and the way it has been designed. Welfare-to-work programme is the new programme in South Africa and the purpose of the study is to explore how the programme has impacted on the livelihoods of the participants. It is important to understand the programme; and the views of the participants about the programme. I therefore wish to invite you to participate in my study. Your participation is entirely voluntary and refusal to participate will not be held against you in any way. If you agree to take part, I shall arrange to interview you at a time and place that is suitable for you. The interview will last approximately one hour. You may also refuse to answer questions that you feel uncomfortable with answering.

With your permission, the interview will be recorded. No one other than my supervisor will have access to the tapes. The tapes and interview schedules will be kept in a locked cabinet for two years following any publications or for six years if no publications emanate from the study. Please note that your name and personal details will be kept confidential and no identifying information will be included in the final research report.

As the interview, will include sensitive issues there is possibility that you may experience some feelings of emotional distress. Should you therefore feel the need for support counseling
following the interview, I have arranged for this service to be provided free of charge by the social worker working for Department of Social Development. Her name is Ms. Jermina Sepuru to make appointment; she may be contacted at 016 930 2168. Please contact me on 0607126110 or my supervisor Ms. Priscilla Gerrand on 011 717 4475. If you have any questions regarding the study, we shall answer them to the best of our ability. Should you wish to receive a summary of the results of the study, an abstract will be made available or upon request.

Thank you for taking time to consider participating in the study

Yours Sincerely

Mr. Tani Radebe
APPENDIX D: INTERVIEW GUIDELINE

1. How were you recruited to be part of the programme?
2. What motivated you to participate in the Welfare-to-Work programme?
3. How did the programme impacted on your livelihood?
4. What were the weaknesses and strengths of the programme?
5. If someone can come to you, and inform you that she was selected to be part of the programme and is not sure whether to accept or not, how will you advise her?
MR TANI RADEBE

Dear Mr Tani Radebe

RE: APPLICATION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN THE GAUTENG DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Thank you for your application to conduct research within the Gauteng Department of Social Development.

Your application on the research on "The Welfare-to-Work Programme – Perceptions and Experiences of Young Women in Receipt of Child Support Grant who Completed the Programme in Johannesburg" has been considered and approved for support by the Department as it was found to be beneficial to the Department's vision and mission. The approval is subject to the Department's terms and conditions as endorsed on the 17th of August 2017.

May I take this opportunity to wish you well on the journey you are about to embark on.

We look forward to a value adding research and a fruitful co-operation.

With thanks

[Signature]

Mr M MAMPURU
Acting Head of Department
Date: 2017/08/28
DEPARTMENTAL HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (SOCIAL WORK) CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

PROTOCOL NUMBER: sw117/05/02

PROJECT TITLE: Welfare-to-Work Programme implemented by the Department of Social Development in Johannesburg: Young women's perceptions of how completion of this programme impacted on their livelihoods.

RESEARCHER(S): Radebe, Tani (0304682W)

SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT: SHCD Social Work

DATE CONSIDERED: 15 June 2017

DECISION OF THE COMMITTEE: Approved

EXPIRY DATE: 23 September 2019

DATE: 22 September 2017 CHAIRPERSON: Dr F. Masson

Cc: Supervisor: Dr P. Gerrand

DECLARATION OF RESEARCHER(S)

To be completed in DUPLICATE and ONE COPY returned to the Administrative Assistant, Room 8, Department of Social Work, Umthombo Building Basement.

I/We fully understand the conditions under which I am/we are authorised to carry out the abovementioned research and I/we guarantee to ensure compliance with these conditions. Should any departure to be contemplated from the research procedure as approved I/we undertake to resubmit the protocol to the committee. For Masters and PhD an annual progress report is required.

______________________________  ________________________________
SIGNATURE                      DATE