AN ECOSYSTEMIC APPROACH TO ASSESSING BARRIERS TO LEARNING: A CASE STUDY IN A SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SECONDARY SCHOOL

Name: Nicole Blumenthal
Supervisor: Elaine Harcombe

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Educational Psychology

Johannesburg, 2007
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Masters of Arts in Educational Psychology at the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted for any other degree or examination at any other university.

_______________________________
Nicole Blumenthal
September 2007
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my supervisor and mentor, Elaine Harcombe. Thank you for your wisdom, guidance and patience regarding the co-creation of this research report. You have guided me through my honours and masters’ degrees and have helped shaped me as a learning support specialist and a psychologist. I will always be grateful.

My parents, Gilda and Cecil. Thank you for providing me with the opportunity to fulfill my dreams and for having faith in my ability to be the best that I can be. Your continuous love, support and wisdom in everything I do has helped me grow into the woman I am today.

My husband, Greg. Thank you for being my rock and supporting me in whatever I do. I will never forget the amount of time you sat on your own whilst I worked on my research report. I am eternally grateful for all your support and encouragement.

My brothers, Marc and Jonathon. Thank you for your constant encouragement and support throughout the years and for inspiring me to realise and fulfill my dreams.

The Smookler and Hurvitz families. Thank you for continuously taking an interest in my work and supporting everything I have chosen to do. The road traveled is always easier knowing you have family support behind you.

To all my friends. I am eternally grateful for your support, wisdom and patience throughout the years, as well as the time you have taken to engage in discussions regarding the personal and academic areas of my life.

To Jeffrey Kagan. Thank you for taking the time to read this research report and for offering your constructive feedback. I would also like to thank you for the last five years of your support, advice and constant holding. You have helped shape me into who I am today and for this I will be forever grateful.

I would like to thank the participants for their role in the research process. This endeavour would have been impossible without your contribution.
ABSTRACT

Recent legislation in South Africa has changed education considerably, particularly in the move towards inclusive education. Previous educational provision in South Africa, as in many countries, assigned many learners with learning difficulties to segregated settings. Such placements tended to be based on the psycho-medical, intelligence-testing model of identifying learning difficulties. Much research has queried the effectiveness of this approach. However, as no alternative model has been researched, it was decided to research the effectiveness of using an ecosystemic approach in conjunction with a collaborative consultancy model as a method for identifying learning needs in high school learners in a South African public secondary school.

Various methods of qualitative data collection were used during the intervention, and comparative analysis was employed to analyse the data. The findings of this study suggest that an ecosystemic approach used together with a collaborative consultancy approach to identify and understand learning diversity is a viable process in inclusive education contexts. However, it is acknowledged that a considerable body of research needs to be achieved before this finding can be considered conclusive. In addition, certain constraints to using this approach were acknowledged, and these include the time, expertise and money needed to facilitate the process successfully.


**CONTENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Declaration ...................................................................................ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements ............................................................................. iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract ............................................................................................ iv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ......................................................... 1**

| Rationale ............................................................................................ 3 |
| Definition of keywords ........................................................................ 4 |
| Structure of the research report ....................................................... 5 |

**CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW .............................................. 7**

| The identification of learning difficulties ........................................ 8 |
| Towards a constructivist, ecosystemic framework for identifying learning differences ................................................................. 11 |
| Ecosystemic thinking and assessment procedures ................................ 12 |
| Using Constructivist, Ecosystemic Approaches to Assessment: Harcombe’s Ecosystemic Assessment Graphic Organiser (EAGO) ......................... 14 |
| Ecosystemic thinking and support delivery ........................................ 14 |
| Conclusion .......................................................................................... 16 |

**CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ....................................................... 17**

| 3.1 Aim .............................................................................................. 17 |
| 3.1.1 Research Questions .................................................................. 17 |
| 3.1.2 Research Design ...................................................................... 18 |
| 3.2 Context of Study .......................................................................... 19 |
| 3.2.1 The school .............................................................................. 19 |
| 3.2.2 The participants ...................................................................... 20 |
| 3.3 Intervention programmes .......................................................... 22 |
| 3.3.1 Description of pre-intervention process ..................................... 22 |
| 3.3.2 Description of intervention process ......................................... 23 |
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS

4.1 Findings regarding Harcombe’s EAGO

4.1.1 Participants’ ability to fill in the EAGO effectively

4.1.2 Understanding of the concepts that underpin the EAGO

4.2 Findings of collaborative consultancy

4.2.1 Participants’ ability to understand and use collaboration

4.2.2 Participants’ ability to apply the concepts of collaborative consultancy to supporting each other when using Harcombe’s EAGO

Overall summary of study results

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION

5.1 Using an ecosystemic approach for identifying and understanding learning diversity and needs

5.2 Using a collaborative consultancy approach intervention research to identify and understand learning diversity and needs

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND LIMITATIONS

REFERENCES

APPENDIX A

Harcombe’s Ecosystemic Assessment Graphic Organiser (EAGO)

Motivation for using a collaborative consultancy approach
### APPENDIX B

- Participants’ biographical questionnaire .......................................................... 60
- Participant information ..................................................................................... 61
- Data collection .................................................................................................... 63
- Pre-intervention process ................................................................................... 64
- Intervention process ........................................................................................ 65
- Letter to participants informing them of workshop date and times ..................... 68
- Survey of personal experiences at school ......................................................... 69
- Evaluation sheet for workshop 1 ....................................................................... 70
- Jabu’s Case Study ............................................................................................. 72
- Harcombe’s EAGO ........................................................................................... 75
- Evaluation sheet for workshop 2 ....................................................................... 76
- Evaluation sheet for workshop 3 ....................................................................... 78
- Evaluation sheet for workshop 4 ....................................................................... 80
- Informal Reading Assessment ......................................................................... 82

### APPENDIX C

- Permission letter from Humanities Faculty ....................................................... 84
- Permission letter from Department of Education .............................................. 85
- Permission letter from Westbury Secondary School ...................................... 87
- Subject Information Sheet .............................................................................. 88
- Example of the certificates issued .................................................................. 90
APPENDIX D ……………………………………………………………………………… 91
Examples of evaluation forms the participants filled in …………………………… 91
Examples of Harcombe’s EAGO the participants filled in ………………………… 93
Research Question 1 …………………………………………………………………… 95
Research Question 2 …………………………………………………………………… 101
Research Question 3 …………………………………………………………………… 109
Research Question 4 …………………………………………………………………… 111
Research Question 5 …………………………………………………………………… 117